1 Volcanic radiative forcing from 1979 to 2015

- 2 Anja Schmidt^{1,2}, Michael J. Mills³, Steven Ghan⁴, Jonathan M. Gregory^{5,6}, Richard P. Allan^{6,7},
- 3 Timothy Andrews⁸, Charles G. Bardeen³, Andrew Conley³, Piers M. Forster⁹, Andrew Gettelman³,
- 4 Robert W. Portmann¹⁰, Susan Solomon¹¹, and Owen B. Toon¹²
- ¹Department of Chemistry, University of Cambridge, Lensfield Road, Cambridge CB2 1EW, UK
- ⁶ ²Department of Geography, University of Cambridge, Downing Place, Cambridge CB2 3EN, UK
- 7 ³Atmospheric Chemistry Observations and Modeling Laboratory, National Center for Atmospheric Research,
- 8 Boulder, CO 80307
 ⁴Atmospheric Sciences and Global Change Division, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory, Richland, WA
 ⁵NCAS-Climate, University of Reading, Reading, UK
- ⁶Department of Meteorology, University of Reading, Reading, UK
- 11 ⁷National Centre for Earth Observation, United Kingdom
- ⁸Met Office, FitzRoy Road, Exeter, EX1 3PB, UK

⁹School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, LS2 9JT, UK

- 13 ¹⁰NOAA Earth Systems Research Laboratory (ESRL) Chemical Sciences Division, Boulder, Colorado, USA
- 14 ¹¹Department of Earth, Atmospheric, and Planetary Sciences, Massachusetts Institute of Technology,
- 15 Cambridge, MA 02139
- 16 ¹²Department of Atmospheric and Oceanic Sciences, Laboratory for Atmospheric and Space Physics, University
- 17 of Colorado, Boulder, CO 80303

Corresponding author: Anja Schmidt Email: <u>anja.schmidt@ch.cam.ac.uk</u>

Revised manuscript submitted to Journal of Geophysical Research

Last modified 10 August 2018

18 Key points:

- 19
- Small-magnitude eruptions caused a global-mean ERF of -0.08 W m⁻² during 2005-2015 relative to
 the volcanically quiescent 1999-2002 period
- 22 2) In our model rapid adjustments act to reduce the total volcanic forcing per unit SAOD change by
 23 13-21% for large-magnitude eruptions
- 24 3) On average, frequent small-magnitude eruptions increase non-volcanic background SAOD by
- 25 0.004, equating to a volcanic ERF of -0.10 W m⁻²

26 Abstract

27

28 Using volcanic sulfur dioxide emissions in an aerosol-climate model we derive a time-series of global-29 mean volcanic effective radiative forcing (ERF) from 1979 to 2015. For 2005-2015, we calculate a global multi-annual mean volcanic ERF of -0.08 W m⁻² relative to the volcanically quiescent 1999-30 31 2002 period, due to a high frequency of small-to-moderate-magnitude explosive eruptions after 2004. 32 For eruptions of large magnitude such as 1991 Mt. Pinatubo, our model-simulated volcanic ERF, 33 which accounts for rapid adjustments including aerosol perturbations of clouds, is less negative than 34 that reported in the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) Fifth Assessment Report 35 (AR5) that only accounted for stratospheric temperature adjustments. We find that, when rapid 36 adjustments are considered, the relation between volcanic forcing and volcanic stratospheric optical 37 depth (SAOD) is 13-21% weaker than reported in IPCC AR5 for large-magnitude eruptions. Further, 38 our analysis of the recurrence frequency of eruptions reveals that sulfur-rich small-to-moderate-39 magnitude eruptions with column heights ≥ 10 km occur frequently, with periods of volcanic 40 quiescence being statistically rare. Small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions should therefore be 41 included in climate model simulations, given the >50% chance of one or two eruptions to occur in any 42 given year. Not all of these eruptions affect the stratospheric aerosol budget, but those that do increase 43 the non-volcanic background SAOD by ~ 0.004 on average, contributing $\sim 50\%$ to the total SAOD in 44 the absence of large-magnitude eruptions. This equates to a volcanic ERF of about -0.10 W m^{-2} , which 45 is about two-thirds of the ERF from ozone changes induced by ozone-depleting substances.

46 47

48 Plain language summary

49

50 We calculate the climatic effects of explosive volcanic eruptions between 1979 and 2015 using a more 51 complex climate model simulation than has been used previously. This includes many of the chemical 52 and physical processes that lead to the formation of volcanic aerosol, tiny airborne particles that cause 53 reflection of sunlight and trapping of thermal infra-red radiative energy and are important for Earth's 54 climate. We find that the most powerful eruptions between 1979 and 2015 had a substantial climatic 55 impact. However, we calculate that their effect on climate is about 20% weaker than previous 56 estimates used by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC). In our model simulation 57 this is mainly a result of the volcanic aerosol particles affecting ice clouds, making these clouds less 58 transparent. We also find that it is very rare to have a period with relatively few notable explosive 59 eruptions as was the case during 1996-2002. Further eruptions of small-to-moderate size occur 60 frequently and decrease the transparency of the stratosphere by as much as all non-volcanic sources of 61 aerosol particles combined. These small-sized volcanic eruptions therefore cause a small but 62 noticeable surface cooling and so should be included in climate model simulations, which is rarely 63 done.

64 **1** Introduction

65

66 Radiative forcing from human activity is primarily responsible for the warming of climate since 67 the 1950s, yet increases in global surface temperature have not progressed smoothly [Morice et al., 68 2012; Fyfe et al., 2013a]. Changes in the decadal rate of global warming have been attributed to 69 several factors including internal climate variability [Marotzke and Forster, 2015] thought to be 70 driven mainly by variability in the Pacific Decadal Oscillation [Trenberth and Fasullo, 2013], biases 71 and variability arising from the treatment of the surface temperature observations themselves [Cowtan 72 and Way, 2014; Karl et al., 2015], and temporal changes in natural and anthropogenic forcings such as 73 tropospheric anthropogenic aerosol, solar irradiance and volcanic eruptions [Solomon et al., 2011; 74 Haywood et al., 2014; Santer et al., 2014; Schmidt et al., 2014; Monerie et al., 2017].

75

76 Ouantifying human-caused climate change and the effectiveness of mitigation strategies demands 77 the accurate attribution of present and future changes of Earth's energy budget and surface 78 temperature not only to anthropogenic, but also to natural climate forcing agents such as volcanic 79 eruptions. Previous work found a statistically significant correlation between the occurrence of a series 80 of small-to-moderate-magnitude explosive volcanic eruptions since the year 2000 and observed 81 temperature changes in the lower troposphere [Santer et al., 2014]. It has also been shown that climate 82 models that neglect forcing from volcanic eruptions since the year 2000 tend to project a faster rate of 83 global warming for the first 15 years of the 21st century than those models including this volcanic 84 forcing [Solomon et al., 2011; Fyfe et al., 2013a; Santer et al., 2014; Schmidt et al., 2014]. The 85 volcanic forcing time-series used in those studies were based on satellite-derived estimates of volcanic 86 Stratospheric Aerosol Optical Depth (SAOD) above 380 K in potential temperature [Vernier et al., 87 2011]; that is about 17 km above sea level in the tropics and about 14 km at mid-latitudes.

88

89 Historically the volcanic SAOD datasets used to force climate models were restricted to altitudes 90 above 380 K in potential temperature because (1) this is where initially most of the volcanic aerosol 91 following large-magnitude explosive eruptions resides, and (2) retrieving aerosol properties is 92 challenging when dense volcanic aerosol plumes and/or liquid water and ice clouds are present near or 93 below 380 K [Fromm et al., 2014; Andersson et al., 2015]. However, analysis of lidar, Aerosol 94 Robotic Network, and balloon-borne data suggests that depending on location, season and volcanic 95 activity, up to 70% of the volcanic SAOD between 2004 and 2015 resided in the lowermost 96 stratosphere [Ridley et al., 2014] (defined as the region between the tropopause and the 380 K 97 potential temperature level). Comparisons of space-borne measurements and aircraft measurements 98 also suggest that on average 30% of the global SAOD between 2008 and 2011 resided in the 99 lowermost stratosphere [Andersson et al., 2015]. Aerosol-climate model simulations of volcanic 100 aerosol properties from 1990 to 2014 similarly suggest that following the 2008 Kasatochi eruption, up 101 to 54% of the global SAOD resided in the lowermost stratosphere [Mills et al., 2016], in good 102 agreement with lidar, space-borne and aircraft measurements [Ridley et al., 2014; Andersson et al., 103 2015]. Therefore to accurately represent the magnitude of volcanic forcing of climate and its potential 104 contribution to global warming rates, climate model simulations should account for lowermost 105 stratosphere volcanic aerosol as demonstrated by several studies [Solomon et al., 2011; Schmidt et al., 106 2014] using up-to-date satellite-based volcanic SAOD datasets [Thomason et al., 2018].

107

Instead of prescribing a satellite-based SAOD dataset, we derive a time-series of global-mean volcanic effective radiative forcing (ERF) for the period 1979 to 2015, accounting for volcanic aerosol in the lowermost stratosphere and rapid adjustments (including atmospheric temperature and clouds amongst others), by using a detailed volcanic sulfur dioxide (SO₂) emission inventory in a climate model (CESM1) with comprehensive sulfur chemistry and a prognostic stratospheric aerosol scheme

113 (WACCM-MAM). As far as we are aware there is only one other study to date by Ge et al. [2016], 114 which used an emissions-based approach to derive a volcanic forcing time-series for the period 2005 115 to 2012 in an aerosol-climate model. Crucially, in contrast to our study, Ge et al. [2016] do not 116 account for the contributions of aerosol-cloud interactions and longwave forcings to the total volcanic 117 forcing. In our study, we decompose the total volcanic ERF into contributions from aerosol-radiation 118 interactions and aerosol-cloud interactions. We also present a statistical analysis of the recurrence 119 frequencies of explosive eruptions of different magnitudes and discuss their effects on the 120 stratospheric aerosol budget and radiative forcing of global climate.

121 2 Methods

122 123

2 2.1 CESM1(WACCM) model set-up

124 Simulations were run over the period January 1979 to December 2015 using the Community Earth 125 System Model, version 1 (CESM1) with the Whole Atmosphere Community Climate Model version 126 (hereafter: WACCM) at a resolution of 1.9° latitude x 2.5° longitude. WACCM includes a prognostic 127 modal aerosol model (MAM) and a detailed sulfur chemistry scheme [Mills et al., 2016]. As described 128 in Mills et al. [2016] sulfur emitted from anthropogenic and natural sources such as dimethyl sulfide 129 (DMS) and carbonyl sulfide (OCS) is accounted for in the simulations. To diagnose the volcanic ERF, 130 we run one simulation with and one without volcanic sulfur dioxide (SO₂) emissions. The volcanic 131 SO₂ emission inventory [Neely and Schmidt, 2016] has been used and described previously [Mills et 132 al., 2016; Solomon et al., 2016]. Briefly, the inventory contains volcanic eruptions that emitted SO_2 133 either directly into the stratosphere or the troposphere. The emission inventory containing information 134 on the mass of SO₂ emitted and volcanic plume heights for eruptions that had a measurable SO₂ signal 135 was compiled based on a variety of published and/or freely available measurements from satellites 136 including Total Ozone Mapping Spectrometer (TOMS), Ozone Monitoring Instrument (OMI), Ozone 137 Mapping Profile Suite (OMPS), Infrared Atmospheric Sounding Interferometer (IASI), Global Ozone 138 Monitoring Experiment (GOME/2), Atmospheric Infrared Sounder (AIRS), Microwave Limb Sounder 139 (MLS), Michelson Interferometer for Passive Atmospheric Sounding (MIPAS), as well as ground-140 based remote sensing or petrological methods. The plume heights were compiled based on published 141 estimates of the eruption source parameters and reports from the Smithsonian Global Volcanism 142 (http://volcano.si.edu/), Program NASA's Global Sulfur Dioxide Monitoring website 143 well the Support (http://so2.gsfc.nasa.gov/) as as to Aviation Control Service 144 (http://sacs.aeronomie.be/). Several other volcanic SO₂ emission inventories exist [Diehl et al., 2012; 145 Brühl et al., 2015; Carn et al., 2016; Bingen et al., 2017] and a detailed comparison of the differences 146 and similarities can be found in Timmreck et al. [2018].

147

148 Model simulations were run specifying time-varying historical sea-surface (but not land-surface) 149 temperatures and sea-ice [Hurrell et al., 2008]. Zonal and meridional winds and surface pressures 150 from the lowermost atmospheric layer to 50 km were relaxed with a 50-hour timescale towards 151 meteorological reanalysis fields from the NASA Global Modeling and Assimilation Office Modern-152 Era Retrospective Analysis for Research and Applications (MERRA) [Rienecker et al., 2011]. This 153 set-up, referred to as "nudged-uv" from here on (where u and v denote the eastward and northward 154 components of wind), improves consistency between the simulated and observed meteorological 155 conditions, but means our ERF will not include the radiative impact of any circulations changes (see 156 below).

157

158 In *Mills et al.* [2016], we compared model-simulated volcanic aerosol properties such as SAOD 159 for both large-magnitude eruptions and smaller-magnitude volcanic eruptions to a range of in-situ and remote-sensing observations . Figure 1 shows that the model-simulated SAOD at 550 nm compares very well to the Coupled Model Inter-comparison Project (CMIP) phase 6 SAOD (downloaded from <u>ftp://iacftp.ethz.ch/pub_read/luo/CMIP6/</u>) during a volcanically quiescent period (1998-2000) and a period of frequent volcanic activity (2005-2014). The CMIP6 SAOD dataset from 1979 onwards is further described in *Thomason et al.* [2018]

165 166

2.2 Diagnosing volcanic effective radiative forcings

167 Applying nudged u and v components of the wind in our model simulations, although still an 168 imperfect approach, has the advantage of ensuring that the volcanic ERF we diagnose is minimally 169 influenced by atmospheric adjustments due to circulation changes. Such adjustments affect other 170 methods of diagnosing ERF, such as those based on either prescribed sea-surface temperature or 171 regression approaches [Forster et al., 2016]. Several studies showed that ERFs including the radiative 172 effects from aerosol-cloud interactions can be diagnosed from nudged-uv simulations with similar 173 accuracy to that obtainable from methods where only sea-surface temperatures and sea-ice are 174 prescribed [Kooperman et al., 2012; Zhang et al., 2014; Forster et al., 2016]. In our case nudging the 175 wind components allows us to isolate relatively small forcings because natural variability and climate 176 feedbacks are largely the same in simulations with and without volcanic emissions while other factors 177 such as clouds and stratospheric temperatures are allowed to adjust under the presence of volcanic 178 sulfate aerosol particles. However, as a consequence, certain rapid adjustments, such as cloud cover 179 changes due to changes in dynamics are unaccounted for in our set-up, whereas adjustments via 180 changes in both liquid water and ice cloud microphysical properties (i.e. particle number 181 concentrations and particle size) are accounted for. Therefore, the nudged-uv volcanic ERF (hereafter 182 referred to as "volcanic ERF") diagnosed from our simulations can be thought of as a partially 183 adjusted ERF, which does not correspond exactly to the IPCC definitions of either ERF or 184 Instantaneous Radiative Forcing (IRF) [Forster et al., 2016]. To characterize some of the limitations 185 of our approach we compare the results to a set of free-running simulations with specified time-186 varying sea-surface temperatures and sea-ice.

187

188 We decompose the volcanic ERF (Δ F in Equation 1 below) into its components by applying a 189 previously developed method [*Ghan*, 2013] and extending it to the longwave forcing.

- 190 191
- 192

 $\Delta F = \Delta (F - F_{clean}) + \Delta (F_{clean} - F_{clean, clear}) + \Delta F_{clean, clear}$ (Eq. 1)

193 where F is the net (positive downward) radiative (shortwave (SW) or longwave (LW)) flux at the 194 top of the atmosphere, and Δ denotes the difference between simulations with and without volcanic 195 SO_2 emissions. The decomposition is enabled by implementing extra calls to the radiation code to 196 obtain F_{clean} and F_{clean,clear} in both simulations (see below for further details). F_{clean} denotes a diagnostic 197 calculation of the flux that ignores scattering and absorption by all aerosols (not just volcanic aerosol), 198 but it includes aerosol-cloud interactions through microphysics. F_{clean,clear} denotes a diagnostic 199 calculation that ignores the radiative effects of clouds as well as aerosols. In the model, microphysical 200 effects of sulfur on cloud droplet and cloud ice mass mixing ratios and number concentrations are 201 represented in a two-moment cloud microphysics scheme [Morrison and Gettelman, 2008], which also 202 includes process-based treatments of ice microphysics such as ice nucleation [Gettelman et al., 2010]. 203 The ice nucleation scheme used is the same as described in Mills et al. [2017] except for one update to 204 the homogeneous freezing routine to enable coarse-mode sulfate aerosol particles to nucleate ice via 205 homogeneous freezing. F-F_{elean} therefore determines the impact of all aerosols on F through aerosol-206 radiation interactions, so the first term $\Delta(F-F_{clean})$ is an estimate of forcing from aerosol-radiation 207 interactions (ERFari) due to volcanic emissions. The second term $\Delta(F_{clean}-F_{clean,clear})$, the difference in 208 the "clean-sky" cloud radiative forcing, is an estimate of forcing from aerosol-cloud interactions

209	(ERFaci) due to volcanic emissions. The third term $\Delta F_{clean,clear}$ accounts for changes in surface albedo
210	in the shortwave and in the longwave for changes such as surface temperature and water vapor profiles
211	(i.e., changes not due directly to aerosol or cloud).
212	
213	In more detail, the model diagnostics are as follows:
214	
215	S = net positive downward shortwave flux at top of atmosphere (TOA)
216	S_{clear} = clear-sky net positive downward shortwave flux at TOA
217	S _{clean} = net positive downward shortwave flux at TOA that ignores scattering and absorption by <i>all</i>
218	aerosols (not just volcanic aerosol)
219	S _{clean,clear} = clear-sky net positive downward shortwave flux at TOA that ignores scattering and
220	absorption by all aerosols (not just volcanic aerosol)
221	L = net positive downward longwave flux at TOA
222	L_{clear} = clear-sky net positive downward longwave flux at TOA
223	L _{clean} = net positive downward longwave flux at TOA that ignores scattering and absorption by <i>all</i>
224	aerosols (not just volcanic aerosol)
225	$L_{clean,clear}$ = clear-sky net positive downward longwave flux at TOA that ignores scattering and
226	absorption by <i>all</i> aerosols (not just volcanic aerosol)
227	
228	Each of these quantities is diagnosed in the simulations both with and without volcanic SO ₂ emissions,
229	denoted by $^{\rm V}$ and $^{\rm N}$ respectively.
230	
231	SW forcing from aerosol-radiation interactions:
232	
233	dSW ERFari = Δ (S - S _{clean}) = (S ^V - S _{clean} ^V) - (S ^N - S _{clean} ^N)
234	
235	SW forcing from aerosol-cloud interactions:
236	
237	$dSW_ERFaci = \Delta (S_{clean} - S_{clean, clear}) = (S_{clear} \vee - S_{clean, clear} \vee) - (S_{clear} \vee - S_{clean, clear})$
238	
239	SW surface albedo forcing:
240	
241	$dSW_ERFa = \Delta (S_{clean,clear}) = S_{clean,clear}^{V} - S_{clean,clear}^{N}$
242	
243	LW forcing from aerosol-radiation interactions:
244	
245	$dLW_ERFari = \Delta (L - L_{clean}) = (L^{V} - L_{clean}^{V}) - (L^{N} - L_{clean}^{N})$
246	
247	LW forcing from aerosol-cloud interactions:
248	
249	$dLW_ERFaci = \Delta (L_{clean} - L_{clean, clear}) = (L_{clear}^{V} - L_{clean, clear}^{V}) - (L_{clear}^{N} - L_{clean, clear}^{N})$
250	
251	LW atmosphere adjustment and surface albedo forcing:
252	
253	$dLW_ERFa = \Delta (L_{clean,clear}) = L_{clean,clear}^{V} - L_{clean,clear}^{N}$
254	
255	Total forcing from aerosol-radiation interactions:
256	
257	$ERFari = dSW_ERFari + dLW_ERFari$

259 Total forcing from aerosol-cloud interactions:

260
261 ERFaci = dSW_ERFaci + dLW_ERFaci
262

263 264

2.3 Energy budget model calculations

265 To illustrate the effects of our volcanic ERF time-series on Earth's energy budget and surface 266 temperature changes we used a globally averaged energy budget model [Forster and Gregory, 2006]. 267 The model's main output is change in surface temperature, which is taken to be the globally averaged 268 temperature of a 100 m mixed layer of ocean. We applied annual globally averaged time-series of 269 volcanic ERF for different scenarios as detailed in Table 1, while other natural and anthropogenic 270 forcings were kept the same for each volcanic forcing scenario and were taken from IPCC [IPCC, 271 2013] and from 2012 onwards using future scenario data [Meinshausen et al., 2011, RCP4.5]. For 272 each scenario the model evolves the energy imbalance and temperature changes through time. The 273 changes in energy budget between 1979 and 2011 resulting from applying our volcanic ERF time-274 series are calculated relative to the volcanic forcing used by IPCC [IPCC, 2013]. In our set-up, the 275 surface temperature response is calculated assuming a constant diffusivity of 276 $0.001 \text{ m}^2 \text{ s}^{-1}$ within the underlying 900-m-deep ocean, along with a Planck response and climate 277 feedback response that emits energy to space to help restore the energy imbalance. This emission to 278 space is given as $Y\Delta T$, where ΔT is the mixed layer temperature change and Y is a climate feedback 279 parameter directly connected to the equilibrium climate sensitivity (ECS), such that ECS = $F_{2 \times CO2}/Y$, 280 where $F_{2\times CO2}$ is the forcing for a doubling of carbon dioxide (+3.7 W m⁻²). To calculate the 281 temperature changes, we set Y to 1.3 W m⁻² K⁻¹, which corresponds to an ECS of 2.85 K.

282 **3 Results and Discussion**

283 284

3.1 Volcanic eruptions and volcanic effective radiative forcing 1979-2015

285 Figure 2 shows the occurrence of explosive volcanic eruptions and the volcanic ERF these 286 eruptions exerted between the years 1979 and 2015. Here, we define small-to-moderate-magnitude 287 volcanic eruptions as those with a Volcanic Explosivity Index (VEI) [Newhall and Self, 1982] of 3, 4, 288 or 5 and emitting a mass of SO₂ of at least 0.01 Tg to altitudes of 10 km or above. Briefly, the period 289 1979 to 2015 is characterized by 18 such small-to-moderate-magnitude volcanic eruptions in the 290 1980s, which emitted a combined total of about 6.3 Tg of SO₂, 6 such eruptions in the 1990s that 291 emitted about 1.4 Tg of SO₂, 22 in the 2000s that emitted about 5.3 Tg of SO₂, and 10 in the 6 years 292 between 2010 and the end of 2015 that emitted about 3.7 Tg of SO₂. The 2000-2015 period was 293 dominated by VEI 3 and VEI 4 eruptions, whereas the 1990s saw one VEI 5 eruption and the last VEI 294 6 eruption to date (1991 Mt. Pinatubo). Between July 2008 and May 2011, a notable series of seven 295 VEI 3-4 eruptions occurred in the mid-latitudes of the Northern Hemisphere, emitting a combined 296 total of 4.4 Tg of SO₂ mainly into the lowermost stratosphere. There also was a series of three VEI 4-5 297 eruptions between May 2008 and April 2015 in the mid-latitudes of the Southern Hemisphere, 298 emitting a total of 0.66 Tg of SO₂. Notably, these were the first VEI 4 and 5 eruptions since Cerro 299 Hudson in 1991 in the Southern Hemisphere.

300

301 Averaged over the 2005-2015 period, which saw a high frequency of VEI 3, 4 and 5 volcanic 302 eruptions in the mid-latitudes of the Northern Hemisphere (Figure 2), the global-mean volcanic ERF 303 in our model is about -0.12 W m⁻² (diagnosed as the difference between simulations with and without 304 volcanic SO₂ emissions, ΔF in Equation (1); see Section 2.2). The volcanic ERF we calculate (Figure 305 2 and Table 1) is in very good agreement with previous work [*Solomon et al.*, 2011], and IPCC's AR5

estimate of -0.11 W m⁻² (-0.15 W m⁻² to -0.08 W m⁻²) for the period 2008-2011 [Myhre et al., 2013]. 306 307 The 1999-2002 period was characterized by relative volcanic quiescence given that only seven 308 eruptions occurred, emitting a combined total of 0.5 Tg of SO₂ (Figure 2b). Our global multi-annual 309 mean volcanic ERF of -0.04 W m⁻² for the period 1999 to 2002 is in good agreement with the IPCC AR5 estimate of -0.06 W m⁻² (-0.08 W m⁻² to -0.04 W m⁻²) [Myhre et al., 2013] for the same period. 310 The change in global-mean volcanic ERF of about -0.08 W m⁻² from -0.04 W m⁻² for 1999-2002 311 312 to -0.12 W m^{-2} for 2005-2015 can be compared with the increase in time-mean carbon dioxide (CO₂) 313 forcing of +0.26 W m⁻² between the same two periods [NOAA, 2016a]. Consequently, the change in 314 global-mean volcanic ERF offsets ~31% of the change in global-mean CO₂ forcing according to the 315 model. It is, therefore, important to include post-2004 small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions in Earth 316 system model simulations to accurately simulate decadal timescale climate changes.

317

318 Figure 3 shows that for both the period following the 1991 Mt. Pinatubo eruption (1991-1994) and 319 the 2000-2015 period the model-simulated net global-mean radiative flux anomalies are in reasonable 320 agreement (R of 0.78 and 0.80, respectively) with satellite-derived fluxes using merged Earth 321 Radiation Budget Satellite (ERBS) data and measurements from the Clouds and the Earth's Radiant 322 Energy System (CERES EBAF v4.0) [Loeb et al., 2017]. In line with previous work [e.g., Hansen et 323 al., 2005; Forster and Taylor, 2006], we find that volcanic ERF from aerosol-radiation interactions 324 (ERFari; blue line Figure 2a) dominates the total volcanic ERF (black line Figure 2) following large-325 magnitude explosive eruptions such as 1991 Mt. Pinatubo. For 1991 Mt. Pinatubo, we calculate a peak global monthly-mean net radiative flux anomaly of -3.2 W m⁻² in September 1991 (Figure 2), in good 326 327 agreement with the peak radiative flux anomaly derived from 60°S-60°N ERBS satellite broadband 328 non-scanner measurements during the Earth Radiation Budget Experiment (ERBE) [Minnis et al., 329 1993], which were merged with additional data to provide continuous monthly global coverage [Allan 330 et al., 2014].

331

332 To date, few studies have investigated the role of rapid adjustments including the forcing from 333 aerosol-cloud interactions (ERFaci) in modulating the total forcing from large-magnitude volcanic 334 eruptions [Hansen et al., 2005; Gregory et al., 2016; Larson and Portmann, 2016], and as far as we 335 are aware no study focused on deriving a volcanic ERF time-series that accounts for both large-336 magnitude and small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions. Figures 2a and 4 highlight that, in our simulations, ERFaci (orange line in Figure 2a) is small (range of -0.27 W m⁻² and +0.22 W m⁻²) 337 338 compared to ERFari (minimum of -2.67 W m⁻²) and of similar magnitude no matter what the 339 magnitude of an eruption. For the 2005 to 2015 period, when there were no VEI 6 eruptions, the 340 model-simulated total LW forcing is dominated by the LW forcing from aerosol-cloud interactions 341 (dLW ERFaci). This is in contrast to the 1991-1994 Pinatubo period, when the LW forcing from 342 aerosol-radiation interactions dominated (Figure 4). For both the El Chichón period (1982-1985) and 343 the Pinatubo period (1991-1994), ERFari dominated because a large amount of sulfate was carried 344 high into the stratosphere (Figure S1) by the rising branch of the Brewer-Dobson circulation, which 345 was accelerated by heating in the volcanic cloud, causing strong reflection of shortwave radiation that 346 exceeds absorption of outgoing longwave radiation. For eruptions after 2004, the total shortwave 347 radiative flux anomalies are smaller than during the Pinatubo period and of comparable magnitude to 348 the total LW forcing (Figure 4). This is mainly a result of lower SO_2 masses emitted into lower 349 altitudes (upper troposphere/lower stratosphere) after the year 2004, which results in reduced sulfate 350 aerosol mass mixing ratios and shorter aerosol particle lifetimes in the stratosphere compared to the 351 Pinatubo period (Figure S1). This in turn increases the relative importance of aerosol-cloud 352 interactions in both the LW and SW for small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions compared to larger-353 magnitude eruptions like 1991 Mt. Pinatubo.

355 While the model-simulated net and LW downward radiative flux anomalies are in reasonable 356 agreement with satellite-based estimates for the Mt. Pinatubo period, Figure 3 clearly shows that for 357 the period between 2008 and 2015, the model overestimates both the global-mean SW and LW flux anomalies; the latter by up to 1.26 W m⁻² (0.67 W m⁻² on average) when compared to CERES. For 358 CERES, monthly random errors in mean radiative fluxes are estimated to be ~ 0.2 W m⁻² [Loeb et al., 359 360 2012]. In our model, the LW flux anomalies in 2008-2015 are dominated by a large effect from 361 aerosol-cloud interactions on longwave radiation (dLW ERFaci, yellow line in Figure 4), which 362 results from an increase in the number concentration of ice crystals and a decrease in their size (Figure 363 5) due to the additional sulfur in the upper troposphere/lower stratosphere (Figure S1). Gettelman et 364 al. [2012] and Ghan et al. [2012] found similar-magnitude effects of anthropogenic sulfur emissions 365 on longwave radiative forcing via aerosol modification of cirrus clouds in the Community Atmosphere 366 Model version 5. At present there are no conclusive observations [Sassen, 1992; Luo et al., 2002; 367 Friberg et al., 2015] to confirm or rule out the role of volcanic sulfuric acid particles in altering the 368 properties of ice clouds. Moreover, the results from model studies that investigate the effects of either 369 sulfate geoengineering or volcanic eruptions on the thermodynamic and microphysical properties of 370 cirrus clouds remain equivocal, with the resulting changes in cloudiness, ice crystal number and mass 371 concentrations strongly depending on the freezing parameterisation, the aerosol scheme used, and the 372 aerosol size-number distribution produced by an eruption [e.g., Jensen and Toon, 1992; Lohmann et 373 al., 2003; Kuebbeler et al., 2012; Cirisan et al., 2013; Visioni et al., 2018]. For instance, Jensen and 374 Toon [1992] found an increase in particle number concentrations as a result of large sulfate aerosol 375 particles sedimenting out of the stratosphere and nucleating homogeneously, a reduction of number 376 when heterogeneous nuclei came from the volcanic cloud, and little change when particles were added 377 that were identical to those already present. Several factors including vertical air speeds (cooling rate), 378 the ability of the added particles to impact supersaturation with respect to ice, and the size of the 379 additional particles determines the rate and limits of homogeneous nucleation. Thus particle number 380 concentration could theoretically either increase or decrease, and satellite data and in-situ 381 measurements of the occurrence frequency and microphysical properties of cirrus clouds before and 382 after future eruptions would be highly desirable to better understand the significance of this type of 383 aerosol-cloud interaction.

384 385

3.2 Regression of volcanic effective radiative forcing against SAOD

386 The relationship between volcanic ERF and SAOD is a key metric used to quantify the volcanic 387 forcing of climate and to subsequently contrast its forcing efficacy relative to other climate forcing 388 agents [Hansen et al., 2005]. In IPCC AR5 [Myhre et al., 2013], a relation between volcanic forcing (ΔF in W m⁻²) and volcanic SAOD changes (tau) of $\Delta F \sim -25$ W m⁻² per unit volcanic SAOD change 389 390 is used. The relation stems from the stratospheric adjusted forcing (i.e., only stratospheric 391 temperatures are allowed to adjust) calculated by Hansen et al. [2005] in GISS model E for the 1991 392 Mt. Pinatubo eruption. For 1991 Mt. Pinatubo simulations using prescribed sea-surface temperature, which is equivalent to our model set-up, ΔF equates to -26 W m⁻² per unit volcanic SAOD change 393 (reported as SST-fixed forcing at https://data.giss.nasa.gov/modelforce/strataer/). We therefore use ΔF 394 395 =

396

 $6 -26 \text{ Wm}^2$ for the discussion and comparison of our results to IPCC AR5 from here onwards.

397

Based on our nudged-uv prescribed sea surface temperature simulations, we calculate regression slopes of the annual global-mean total volcanic ERF against the annual global-mean volcanic SAOD (Figure 6). We calculate a slope of -21.5 ± 1.1 W m⁻² for the periods 1982-1985 and 1990-1994 combined during which two large-magnitude eruptions took place. Importantly, the slope we calculate over these two time periods for large magnitude eruptions is $17 \pm 4\%$ less negative than reported in IPCC AR5 [*Myhre et al.*, 2013]. In our model this is mainly a result of the positive LW forcing from 404 aerosol-cloud interactions (dLW ERFaci) caused by an increase in the number concentration of ice 405 crystals in the upper troposphere/lower stratosphere (Figure 5) as discussed in Section 3.1. In addition, 406 the sensitivity of ΔF to $\Delta SAOD$ depends on other factors such as the latitude and season of an eruption 407 [Kravitz and Robock, 2011; Toohey et al., 2011; Andersson et al., 2015] as well as differences in 408 volcanic sulfate mass mixing ratio and aerosol particle sizes between eruptions of different magnitude. 409 Large-magnitude eruptions such as 1982 El Chichón and 1991 Mt. Pinatubo result in greater sulfate 410 mass mixing ratios (Figure S1) and increased aerosol particle size (Figure S2), disproportionally 411 increasing the LW forcing relative to the SW forcing when compared to eruptions after 2004 (Figure 412 4). Sulfate aerosol particles with effective radii of about 0.25 µm scatter incoming solar radiation most 413 efficiently per unit mass. The scattering efficiency per unit mass diminishes inversely with size for 414 radii > 0.25 μ m, and is close to zero for very small particles [Lacis et al., 1992; Lacis, 2015].

415

416 Previous studies also suggested that rapid adjustments act to reduce the total volcanic forcing to a 417 similar or even larger degree compared to our study. For the 1991 Mt. Pinatubo eruption Hansen et al. 418 [2005], who like us accounted for rapid adjustments in the troposphere as well as stratosphere, calculated a slope of -23.0 W m⁻² based on GISS model E simulations. Larson and Portmann [2016] 419 calculated a multi-model mean slope of -20.0 W m² for large-magnitude eruptions when analyzing 420 CMIP5 simulations. Gregory et al. [2016] calculated slopes of -17.0 ± 1.0 W m⁻² and -19.0 ± 0.5 W m⁻² 421 422 ² based on free-running atmosphere-ocean and atmosphere-only simulations with prescribed SAOD 423 using the HadGEM2 model and the HadCM3 model. They found a positive ERFaci as a result of 424 positive SW aerosol-cloud interaction effects, resulting from a reduction in cloud amount and/or cloud 425 thickness following volcanic eruptions. In contrast, we find a negative SW forcing from aerosol-cloud 426 interactions that for large-magnitude eruptions is outweighed by a positive LW forcing from aerosol-427 cloud interactions (Figure 4). Analyzing a set of free-running (i.e. without nudging but specifying 428 time-varying historical sea-surface temperatures and sea-ice) CESM1(WACCM) simulations, we find 429 a positive SW aerosol-cloud interactions effect, as in Gregory et al. [2016]. This is not present in our 430 nudged-uv simulations, likely as a result of neglecting dynamical impacts on clouds in this set-up. 431 Notwithstanding these differences in mechanisms between Gregory et al. [2016] and our study, all 432 studies that accounted for rapid adjustments suggest a less negative total volcanic forcing compared to 433 IPCC AR5 and CMIP5 for large-magnitude eruptions. The mechanisms by which rapid adjustments 434 act to reduce the total volcanic forcing merit further investigation across different models and model 435 set-ups. Based on our work, we suggest focussing on the magnitude and the sign of aerosol-cloud 436 interactions diagnosed in different models and model set-ups.

437 For the period between 2000 and 2015, which was characterised by a series of small-to-moderate-438 magnitude eruptions, we obtain a slope of -26.8 ± 7.8 W m⁻² in our nudged-uv model simulations in 439 close agreement with the stratospherically-adjusted relation reported in IPCC AR5. In our model, 440 however, the standard deviation on the calculated value of the slope is large and the magnitude of the 441 net global mean radiative flux difference between the model and the satellite-derived fluxes for the 442 years 2006 and 2011 is overestimated by up to -0.74 W m⁻² (2006-2001 mean of -0.15 W m⁻²) (Figure 443 3). Initiatives such as The Interactive Stratospheric Aerosol Model Inter-comparison Project (ISA-444 MIP) [Timmreck et al., 2018] are directed at improving the accuracy of the calculations presented 445 here.

Taken together, our work and that by *Hansen et al.* [2005], *Gregory et al.* [2016], and *Larson and Portmann* [2016] suggests that the IPCC AR5 volcanic forcings for large-magnitude eruptions (VEI \geq 6) are likely too negative. The notion of a reduced total volcanic forcing per unit SAOD change is in stark contrast to a previous study by *Ge et al.* [2016] suggesting that the IPCC AR5 formula of $\Delta F = -26 \text{ W m}^{-2}$ per unit volcanic SAOD [*Myhre et al.*, 2013] is an underestimate by up to a factor of three. The difference in results can be explained by the fact that *Ge et al.* [2016] do not account for the SW forcing from aerosol-cloud interactions and neglect all LW forcings in their calculation of the total
volcanic forcing. Figure 4 shows that the total LW forcing offsets a large fraction of the total SW
forcing for the post-2004 period in particular.

455

A reduced total volcanic forcing has implications for Earth's energy budget. Comparing the timeintegrated total forcing reported in IPCC AR5 to ours (see Table 1 for annual-mean volcanic and total forcings), we find that for the Pinatubo period (1991-1996) about 17% more energy (or about +59 MJ m⁻² over that time period) has accumulated in the Earth system, and about 3.6% more energy (or about +24 MJ m⁻²) between 1979 and 2011.

3.3 Frequency of small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions and implications for stratospheric aerosol budget and surface temperature changes

463

464 From Figure 2 it is apparent that small-to-moderate-magnitude volcanic eruptions with column 465 heights ≥ 10 km and SO₂ emissions of at least 0.01 Tg were less frequent between 1996 and 2002 than 466 in the 1980s and the period 2005 to 2015. Although this is a relatively short time period, we used the 467 SO_2 emission inventory (1979-2015) together with information on the VEI to understand how usual or 468 unusual periods like the 1990s or the period 1996 to 2002 were. We find that occurrence and non-469 occurrence of volcanic eruptions are statistically well-described by a Poisson distribution, in line with 470 previous studies [De la Cruz-Reyna, 1991; Roscoe, 2001], but extended here to VEI=3,4 and 5 471 eruptions (Table 2). Importantly, we find that volcanically quiescent periods are rare: there is only a 472 16% chance of no VEI≥3 eruption occurring in any given year (i.e., a volcanically quiescent period), 473 or inversely an 84% chance of at least one VEI \geq 3 eruption with column heights \geq 10 km and SO₂ 474 emissions of at least 0.01 Tg occurring (i.e., a volcanically active period). The chance of the 475 occurrence of one or two such eruptions in any given year is 57%, and the chance of three or more is 476 27% (Table 2). Therefore, the frequent occurrence of these small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions 477 ought to be accounted for in climate model simulations of past, present and future climate change. The 478 high frequency of these eruptions also has consequences for our understanding of the contribution of 479 volcanic eruptions to the stratospheric aerosol budget and Earth's energy budget.

480

481 The majority of models that participated in CMIP5 did not account for volcanic aerosol forcing 482 from small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions after 2004 at all, or prescribed global-mean SAOD 483 values of 0.0001 from the year 2000 onwards [Sato et al., 1993 and 2002 update, see also Schmidt et 484 al., 2014], which was assumed to be representative of volcanically quiescent periods in the absence of 485 large-magnitude eruptions. We apply the total volcanic ERF diagnosed in our model based on volcanic 486 emissions in an energy budget model (that includes all natural and anthropogenic forcings, see Section 487 2.3) to illustrate the effects of accounting for frequent small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions on 488 surface temperature changes after 2004. We compare our results to surface temperature observations 489 and to Schmidt et al. [2014] who repeated CMIP5 simulations using up-to-date satellite-based SAOD 490 estimates. The grey shading in Figure 7 highlights the range of published estimates for global surface 491 temperature changes based on three different datasets [Hansen et al., 2010; Cowtan and Way, 2014; 492 Karl et al., 2015] from which El Niño-Southern Oscillation (ENSO) variability has been removed 493 [e.g. Huber and Knutti, 2014] using linear regression of each temperature dataset against the 494 December-January-February Oceanic Niño Index [NOAA, 2016b]. Corroborating previous studies 495 [Solomon et al., 2011; Fyfe et al., 2013b], our energy budget model calculations illustrate that the 496 effect of volcanic eruptions after 2004 is small (up to about -0.08°C), but discernible in (model-497 simulated) global-mean decadal surface temperature changes (Figure 7, compare black and green 498 lines). The effects of volcanic eruptions after 2004 are also detectable in lower tropospheric 499 temperature measurements [Santer et al., 2014]. The inclusion of the post-2004 volcanic ERF in our 500 energy budget model reduces the gap between the observations and model-simulated temperature changes that apply a volcanic ERF representative of volcanic quiescence after the year 2000 (see green
line in Figure 7) although the causes of this gap are manifold [e.g., *Solomon et al.*, 2011; *Haywood et al.*, 2014; *Santer et al.*, 2014; *Schmidt et al.*, 2014; *Marotzke and Forster*, 2015; *Monerie et al.*, 2017].
Further, the similarity of our model-simulated surface temperature changes and *Schmidt et al.* [2014]
gives further confidence in our approach of using volcanic SO₂ emissions (compare black and blue
lines in Figure 7 with the blue line based on satellite-derived SAOD values).

507

508 The upcoming CMIP6 experiments will be run prescribing volcanic SAOD reconstructions for the 509 current and historical period up to the year 2014 [Evring et al., 2016]. After the year 2014, using a 510 constant SAOD value of 0.01 has been proposed, which over the first ten years will be ramped up 511 linearly from zero to 0.01. The SAOD value of 0.01 is based on the average SAOD value calculated 512 over the historical period that includes VEI≥6 eruptions [Eyring et al., 2016; O'Neill et al., 2016]. The 513 motivation behind using a constant SAOD value of 0.01 stems from the fact that neglecting volcanic 514 forcing (in particular from VEI₂₆ eruptions) will introduce long-term drift in ocean heat content, 515 which in turn affects, for instance, predictions of sea-level rise [Gregory, 2010; Gregory et al., 2013]. 516 However, VEI≥6 have a relatively low recurrence frequency of about 1 eruption every 50 to 60 years 517 on average [Newhall and Self, 1982; Pyle, 1995]. Therefore, prescribing a time-invariant historical 518 mean SAOD of 0.01, which includes VEI 26 events, may not always be the best approach, particularly 519 if modeling groups wish to conduct model assessments of short-term (10 to 20 years) climate 520 projections for periods during which VEI≥6 eruptions are assumed to be absent given their low 521 recurrence frequency.

522

523 Next we quantify the average contribution of small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions to the 524 stratospheric aerosol budget, which enables modeling groups to account for these frequent eruptions in 525 the absence of VEI \geq 6 eruptions. Based on the SO₂ emission inventory we calculate that an average 526 mass of volcanic SO₂ of 0.48 Tg was emitted by all VEI=3, 4 or 5 eruptions with eruption column 527 heights \geq 15 km between 1979-2015. Using our model simulations we then calculate an annual mean 528 ratio of volcanic SAOD to the mass of volcanic SO₂ emitted of 0.009 between 2000 and 2015 (when 529 no VEI₂₆ eruptions occurred). In the absence of large-magnitude eruptions, we find that small-to-530 moderate-magnitude eruptions increase the non-volcanic background SAOD by about 0.004 on 531 average (i.e. statistically representing one VEI=3, 4 or 5 eruption per year emitting 0.48 Tg of SO₂, so 532 0.48 Tg x 0.009 \approx 0.004). An SAOD enhancement of 0.004 equates to a volcanic ERF of -0.10 W m⁻², 533 which is about two-thirds of the magnitude of the ERF from the ozone changes induced by ozone-534 depleting substances [Myhre et al., 2013]. Compared to the non-volcanic SAOD background of 535 ~0.004 (based on 1998-2000 period in CMIP6 SAOD dataset), these eruptions therefore contribute, on 536 average, as much to the total SAOD as all non-volcanic sources (including biomass burning, industrial 537 combustion, mineral dust, meteoric smoke, and natural gaseous precursors such as carbonyl sulfide) 538 combined during periods when large-magnitude eruptions are absent. A recent study by Friberg et al. 539 [2018] using the Cloud-Aerosol LIdar with Orthogonal Polarization (CALIOP) instrument found a 540 similar relative contribution of 40% on average to the total SAOD for the period 2006 to 2015.

541 **4**

542

We derived a time-series of global-mean volcanic ERF, which accounts for rapid adjustments including aerosol perturbations of clouds, for the period 1979 to 2015 using a volcanic sulfur dioxide emission inventory in CESM(WACCM). CESM(WACCM) is a comprehensive climate model with interactive sulfur chemistry and a prognostic stratospheric aerosol scheme. From our emission-based model simulations we calculated a global multi-annual mean volcanic ERF of -0.12 W m⁻² during 2005-2015 relative to a simulation without volcanic sulfur dioxide emissions. Relative to the

Summary and Conclusions

volcanically quiescent 1999-2002 period, the volcanic ERF is -0.08 W m⁻² due to a series of small-tomoderate-magnitude explosive eruptions after 2004 (Table 1 and Figure 2), which is in good agreement with previous studies that used satellite-based volcanic aerosol forcings [*Solomon et al.*, 2011; *Ridley et al.*, 2014; *Andersson et al.*, 2015]. A volcanic ERF of -0.08 W m⁻², albeit small, is significant as it offsets about one-third of the change in global-mean CO₂ forcing between the periods 1999-2002 and 2005-2015.

555

556 Using the method described by Ghan [2013], we decomposed the total volcanic ERF into 557 contributions from aerosol-radiation interactions and aerosol-cloud interactions (Figures 2 and 4). In 558 line with a small number of previous studies that diagnosed volcanic ERFs [Hansen et al., 2005; 559 Gregory et al., 2016; Larson and Portmann, 2016], we found that rapid adjustments act to reduce the 560 total volcanic ERF for large-magnitude explosive eruptions such as 1991 Mt. Pinatubo compared to 561 the stratospherically-adjusted forcing reported in IPCC AR5. The stratospherically-adjusted forcing 562 does not account for rapid adjustments such as cloud responses due to aerosol or radiative heating 563 amongst other processes. Taken together, our work and that by Hansen et al. [2005], Gregory et al. 564 [2016] and Larson and Portmann [2016] suggests that, for large-magnitude eruptions such as 1982 El 565 Chichón and 1991 Mt. Pinatubo, the relation between volcanic forcing and volcanic stratospheric 566 optical depth (SAOD) is 13-21% weaker than reported in IPCC AR5. In our model, the reduced 567 volcanic ERF is caused primarily by a large radiative effect in the longwave from aerosol-cloud 568 interactions that results from an increase in ice crystal number concentrations (yellow line in Figure 4 569 and Figure 5). However, the occurrence of and if so the sign of the net forcing from any such changes 570 in ice crystal number concentrations following volcanic eruptions remains equivocal in observations 571 and strongly dependent on freezing parameterisations in models, thus meriting further investigation. 572 We suggest that multi-model initiatives such as ISA-MIP [Timmreck et al., 2018] focus on the analysis 573 of the magnitude and the sign of aerosol-cloud interactions diagnosed in different models and model 574 set-ups.

575

576 Overall, a reduced total volcanic forcing has implications not only for the relation between 577 volcanic forcing and volcanic SAOD (Figure 6), but also Earth's energy budget and surface 578 temperature changes (Figure 7) as reported in IPCC AR5, as well as the effectiveness of 579 geoengineering using sulfate aerosol to mitigate climate change. Specifically, for the Pinatubo period 580 (1991-1996) our simulations suggest that about 17% more energy than reported by IPCC AR5 has 581 accumulated in the Earth system, and about 3.6% more energy between 1979 and 2011.

582

583 To understand whether the apparent high occurrence frequency of eruptions during the period 584 2005-2015 was unusual or not, we carried out a statistical analysis of the recurrence frequency of 585 small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions with a VEI of 3, 4 or 5, column heights ≥ 10 km and SO₂ 586 emissions of at least 0.01 Tg between 1979 and 2015. We found that the occurrence and non-587 occurrence of VEI=3.4, or 5 eruptions are statistically well-described by a Poisson distribution (Table 588 2) with a 57% chance of the occurrence of one or two eruptions of VEI=3,4, or 5 in any given year. 589 Notably, we argue that volcanically quiescent periods like the one between 1996 and 2002 are rare 590 with only a small chance of 16% of no VEI≥3 eruption occurring in any given year. Taken together, 591 our statistical analysis suggests that the volcanically active period between 2005 and 2015 was not 592 unusual in terms of occurrence frequency of eruptions.

593

Given that volcanically quiescent periods and VEI≥6 eruptions are statistically rarer than periods of frequent small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions (VEI 3 or 4 or 5), these more frequent eruptions should be accounted for in past, present and future assessments of volcanic forcing of global climate change as well as in generating realistic near-term climate forcing scenarios assuming the absence of large-magnitude eruptions. In addition, such information on the probability of occurrence of eruptions

599 and aerosol burdens is also important for estimates of stratospheric ozone loss, which have been 600 shown to be dependent on aerosol assumptions. For example, Solomon et al. [2016] showed that 601 increased aerosols from small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions influenced the recovery of the 602 Antarctic ozone hole. From our model simulations we estimated that small-to-moderate-magnitude 603 eruptions increase, on average, the non-volcanic background SAOD by about 0.004 and thus 604 contribute about 50% to the total SAOD in the absence of large-magnitude eruptions. This equates to a volcanic ERF of -0.10 W m⁻², which is about two-thirds of the magnitude of the ERF from the ozone 605 606 changes induced by ozone-depleting substances [Myhre et al., 2013]. Modeling groups who prescribe 607 SAOD values and wish to run near-term climate projection simulations assuming an absence of large-608 magnitude eruptions simulations could therefore use a global mean SAOD value of 0.004 on top of 609 their non-volcanic background value to account for frequent small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions.

610

611 Paired with enhanced aerosol-chemistry-climate modeling capabilities, long-term remote ground-612 based and satellite-based measurements, there is ever increasing recognition and understanding of the 613 high occurrence frequency and the role of small-to-moderate-magnitude eruptions in contributing to 614 the stratospheric aerosol budget and links to climatic changes. Continued research efforts are needed 615 to better understand and quantify the role of rapid adjustments including liquid water cloud and ice 616 cloud responses in affecting the total volcanic forcing in particular for large-magnitude eruptions such 617 as 1991 Mt. Pinatubo. To do so effectively, continued monitoring of volcanic activity and deriving 618 accurate information on the mass of SO_2 emitted, volcanic plume heights as well as measurements of 619 the microphysical and chemical evolution of volcanic plumes dispersion are vital to initiate and 620 evaluate climate model simulations of volcanic eruptions.

621 Acknowledgements

622 First and foremost, A.S. would like to thank her baby daughter Lexi for sleeping well around the time 623 when the revisions for this paper were due – what a star! A.S. received funding as visiting researcher 624 from the National Center for Atmospheric Research (NCAR). P.M.F., A.S., R.A. and J.M.G. received 625 funding from UK Natural Environment Research Council (NERC) grant NE/N006038/1 and 626 NE/N006054/1 (SMURPHS). J.M.G. was also supported by the NCAS-climate programme. We 627 acknowledge high-performance computing support from would like to Yellowstone 628 (ark:/85065/d7wd3xhc) provided by NCAR's Computational and Information Systems Laboratory. 629 NCAR is sponsored by the National Science Foundation. Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or 630 recommendations expressed in the publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect 631 the views of the National Science Foundation. The Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL) is 632 operated for the Department of Energy (DOE) by Battelle Memorial Institute under Contract DE-633 AC06-76RLO 1830. Work at PNNL was supported by the US DOE Earth System Modeling program. 634 S.S. is partly supported by a grant from the National Science Foundation, 1539972. A.S. thanks Gavin 635 Schmidt, Nicolas Bellouin, Thomas Aubry, and Amanda Maycock for very helpful discussions of this 636 work. We also thank the three anonymous reviewers for their useful and constructive comments. The 637 output of all model simulations discussed in this study are available at the NCAR Earth System Grid at 638 doi:10.5065/D6C53JPS.

640



Date641Date642Figure 1: Comparison of CMIP6 (blue line) and model-simulated (solid black line = including643volcanic sulfur dioxide emissions, dashed black line = omitting volcanic sulfur dioxide emissions)644monthly global-mean stratospheric aerosol optical depth (SAOD) at 550 nm.

16



645

646 Figure 2: Time-series of (a) global 3-month mean nudged-uv total volcanic effective radiative forcing (ERF, in W m⁻², black line) diagnosed in CESM1(WACCM) as the difference between 647 648 simulations with and without volcanic emissions. The volcanic ERF is further decomposed into the 649 forcings from aerosol-radiation interactions (ERFari, blue line) and aerosol-cloud interactions 650 (ERFaci, orange line), and a longwave atmosphere adjustment and surface albedo term (dLW ERFa, 651 purple line) (see Section 2). Panel (b) shows a time-series of volcanic sulfur dioxide (SO₂) emissions 652 (in Tg of SO_2 , shown by the color) used in our simulations as a function of latitude, with the eruption 653 size (indicated by seven distinct sizes of grey circles) using the Volcanic Explosivity Index (VEI) 654 [Newhall and Self, 1982].



655

Figure 3: Time-series of model-simulated net (solid black lines) and total longwave (LW, solid red line) downward radiative flux anomalies compared to deseasonalized satellite broadband anomalies (dashed lines) from (a) the Earth Radiation Budget Satellite (ERBS) [*Minnis et al.*, 1993] merged with additional data to provide a global dataset [*Allan et al.*, 2014] (anomalies calculated w.r.t. 1985-1989 mean) and (b) the Clouds and the Earth's Radiant Energy System (CERES EBAF v4.0) [*Loeb et al.*,

661 2017] (anomalies calculated w.r.t. 2001 mean).



662 663 Figure 4: Time-series of monthly global 3-month mean nudged-uv total shortwave (SW) volcanic 664 forcing (in units of W m⁻², blue line) and total longwave (LW) volcanic forcing (red line) diagnosed in 665 CESM1(WACCM) from simulations with and without volcanic sulfur dioxide emissions. The light 666 blue line shows the SW volcanic forcing from aerosol-cloud interactions (dSW ERFaci) and the 667 yellow line shows the LW volcanic forcing from aerosol-cloud interactions (dLW ERFaci). Grey 668 triangles refer to eruptions represented in the volcanic sulfur dioxide emission inventory used for the 669 simulations.



670 671 Figure 5: (a) Monthly global-mean changes in in-cloud ice crystal effective radius (µm) and (b) 672 monthly global-mean changes in in-cloud ice crystal number concentrations 673 (N_i cm⁻³) diagnosed in CESM1(WACCM) from simulations with and without volcanic sulfur dioxide 674 emissions.

Nudged-uv regression of volcanic forcing against SAOD



675 676 **Figure 6:** Regression of the annual global-mean total volcanic ERF (W m⁻²) against the annual global-

677 mean stratospheric aerosol optical depth (SAOD at 550 nm) changes diagnosed in CESM1(WACCM)

678 for the periods 1979-2015 (black line), 1982-1985 and 1991-1994 combined (blue line), and 2000-679 2015 (dark red line). The inset figure shows the 2000-2015 period in detail.



680

681 Figure 7: Global-mean surface temperature anomalies (w.r.t. 1980-1999 mean) calculated in an 682 energy budget model (that includes all natural and anthropogenic forcings, see Section 2.3) to 683 illustrate the effects of volcanic eruptions post-1990 by applying the annual-mean volcanic ERF from 684 CESM1(WACCM) simulations (black line) and the volcanic forcings used by the majority of CMIP5 685 models [Sato et al., 1993, 2002 update] (green line), and recent updates [Schmidt et al., 2014] (blue 686 line). All forcings applied in energy budged model are listed in Table 1. The difference between the 687 green line and the black line illustrates that the effect of volcanic eruptions after 2004 is small (up to 688 about -0.08°C), but discernible in (model-simulated) global-mean decadal surface temperature 689 changes. The grey shading shows the variability in surface temperature measurements based on three 690 different datasets [Hansen et al., 2010; Cowtan and Way, 2014; Karl et al., 2015] for which ENSO 691 variability has been removed.

692 Tables

693

Table 1. Annual global-mean volcanic forcings (W m⁻²) applied in energy budget model, and total

695 forcing reported in IPCC AR5 (data available at

696 http://www.climatechange2013.org/images/report/WG1AR5_AIISM_Datafiles.xlsx).

697

Year	This study	Schmidt et al. [2014]	IPCC AR5 volcanic forcing	IPCC AR5 total forcing	<i>Sato et al.</i> [1993, 2002 update]
1979	+0.03	-	-0.23	1.15	-0.24
1980	-0.16	-	-0.13	1.28	-0.12
1981	-0.28	-	-0.13	1.31	-0.13
1982	-1.21	-	-1.33	0.08	-1.37
1983	-1.24	-	-1.88	-0.43	-2.0
1984	-0.69	-	-0.75	0.65	-0.78
1985	-0.43	-	-0.33	1.11	-0.33
1986	-0.37	-	-0.35	1.11	-0.35
1987	-0.12	-	-0.25	1.26	-0.27
1988	-0.17	-	-0.2	1.43	-0.2
1989	-0.18	-	-0.15	1.57	-0.16
1990	-0.05	-0.14	-0.15	1.57	-0.15
1991	-1.25	-1.12	-1.35	0.40	-1.35
1992	-2.39	-2.09	-3.03	-1.24	-3.03
1993	-1.23	-0.87	-1.23	0.50	-1.23
1994	-0.63	-0.36	-0.50	1.22	-0.50
1995	-0.26	-0.19	-0.25	1.49	-0.24
1996	-0.09	-0.13	-0.18	1.58	-0.16
1997	-0.06	-0.11	-0.13	1.67	-0.13
1998	+0.01	-0.10	-0.08	1.80	-0.07
1999	-0.04	-0.10	-0.05	1.90	-0.05
2000	-0.10	-0.10	-0.05	1.95	-0.003
2001	+0.003	-0.10	-0.05	1.97	-0.003
2002	-0.02	-0.10	-0.05	1.0	-0.003
2003	-0.08	-0.12	-0.08	1.95	-0.003
2004	-0.04	-0.11	-0.05	1.99	-0.003
2005	-0.08	-0.14	-0.08	1.98	-0.003
2006	-0.13	-0.15	-0.10	1.99	-0.003
2007	-0.24	-0.17	-0.10	2.02	-0.003
2008	-0.03	-0.15	-0.10	2.05	-0.003
2009	-0.26	-0.14	-0.13	2.06	-0.003
2010	-0.09	-0.12	-0.10	2.16	-0.003
2011	-0.11	-0.15	-0.13	2.20	-0.003
2012	-0.10	-0.12	-	-	-0.003
2013	-0.03	-	-	-	-
2014	-0.12	-	_		-
2015	-0.17	-	-	-	-

698

- 699 Table 2. Observed recurrence and Poisson probabilities for (a) volcanic eruptions with known sulfur
- dioxide emissions between 1980-2015 (a period of N=36 years) with a Volcanic Explosivity Index
- 701 [Newhall and Self, 1982], VEI≥ 3, and (b) for VEI=3,4 and 5 eruptions. The volcanic sulfur dioxide
- 702 emission inventory is compiled in *Neely and Schmidt* [2016].

(a) VEI≥ 3	N=36	dt=1yr	λ=1.83
Х	p(x)	Np(x)	Obs
0	0.160	5.756	5
1	0.293	10.552	11
2	0.269	9.673	11
3	0.164	5.911	4
4	0.075	2.709	4
5	0.028	0.993	1
6	0.008	0.304	0
7	0.002	0.079	0

(b) VEI=3, 4, 5	N=36	dt=1yr	λ=1.81
Х	p(x)	Np(x)	Obs
0	0.164	5.918	5
1	0.297	10.685	12
2	0.268	9.646	10
3	0.161	5.806	4
4	0.073	2.621	4
5	0.026	0.946	1
6	0.008	0.285	0
7	0.002	0.073	0

 $p(x) = \lambda^x e^{-\lambda} / x!$

x = number of occurrences (or absence) of eruptions in given VEI category

 λ = mean number of eruptions per dt

p(x) = Poisson probability

Np(x) = calculated expected number of eruptions

Obs = number of eruptions based on database

N = number of years of data

dt = time interval of data

703

704 **REFERENCES**

- Allan, R. P., C. Liu, N. G. Loeb, M. D. Palmer, M. Roberts, D. Smith, and P.-L. Vidale (2014),
 Changes in global net radiative imbalance 1985–2012, Geophysical Research Letters, 41(15),
 5588-5597.
- Andersson, S. M., B. G. Martinsson, J.-P. Vernier, J. Friberg, C. A. M. Brenninkmeijer, M.
 Hermann, P. F. J. van Velthoven, and A. Zahn (2015), Significant radiative impact of volcanic aerosol in the lowermost stratosphere, Nature Communications, 6, 7692.
- Bingen, C., C. E. Robert, K. Stebel, C. Brühl, J. Schallock, F. Vanhellemont, N. Mateshvili, M.
 Höpfner, T. Trickl, J. E. Barnes, J. Jumelet, J.-P. Vernier, T. Popp, G. de Leeuw, and S. Pinnock
 (2017), Stratospheric aerosol data records for the climate change initiative: Development,
 validation and application to chemistry-climate modelling, Remote Sensing of Environment, 203,
 296-321.
- Brühl, C., J. Lelieveld, H. Tost, M. Höpfner, and N. Glatthor (2015), Stratospheric sulfur and its
 implications for radiative forcing simulated by the chemistry climate model EMAC, Journal of
 Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 120(5), 2014JD022430.
- Carn, S. A., L. Clarisse, and A. J. Prata (2016), Multi-decadal satellite measurements of global
 volcanic degassing, Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research, 311, 99-134.
- Cirisan, A., P. Spichtinger, B. P. Luo, D. K. Weisenstein, H. Wernli, U. Lohmann, and T. Peter
 (2013), Microphysical and radiative changes in cirrus clouds by geoengineering the stratosphere,
 Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 118(10), 4533-4548.
- Cowtan, K., and R. G. Way (2014), Coverage bias in the HadCRUT4 temperature series and its
 impact on recent temperature trends, Quarterly Journal of the Royal Meteorological Society,
 140(683), 1935-1944.
- De la Cruz-Reyna, S. (1991), Poisson-distributed patterns of explosive eruptive activity, Bull
 Volcanol, 54(1), 57-67.
- Diehl, T., A. Heil, M. Chin, X. Pan, D. Streets, M. Schultz, and S. Kinne (2012), Anthropogenic,
 biomass burning, and volcanic emissions of black carbon, organic carbon, and SO2 from 1980 to
 2010 for hindcast model experiments, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 12(9), 24895-24954.
- Fyring, V., S. Bony, G. A. Meehl, C. A. Senior, B. Stevens, R. J. Stouffer, and K. E. Taylor (2016),
 Overview of the Coupled Model Intercomparison Project Phase 6 (CMIP6) experimental design
 and organization, Geosci. Model Dev., 9(5), 1937-1958.
- Forster, P. M., and J. M. Gregory (2006), The Climate Sensitivity and Its Components Diagnosed
 from Earth Radiation Budget Data, Journal of Climate, 19(1), 39-52.
- Forster, P. M., T. Richardson, A. C. Maycock, C. J. Smith, B. H. Samset, G. Myhre, T. Andrews, R.
 Pincus, and M. Schulz (2016), Recommendations for diagnosing effective radiative forcing from
 climate models for CMIP6, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 2016JD025320.
- Forster, P. M. F., and K. E. Taylor (2006), Climate Forcings and Climate Sensitivities Diagnosed
 from Coupled Climate Model Integrations, Journal of Climate, 19(23), 6181-6194.
- Friberg, J., B. G. Martinsson, S. M. Andersson, and O. S. Sandvik (2018), Volcanic impact on the climate the stratospheric aerosol load in the period 2006-2015, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 2018, 1-35.
- Friberg, J., B. G. Martinsson, M. K. Sporre, S. M. Andersson, C. A. M. Brenninkmeijer, M. Hermann, P. F. J. van Velthoven, and A. Zahn (2015), Influence of volcanic eruptions on midlatitude upper tropospheric aerosol and consequences for cirrus clouds, Earth and Space Science, 2(7), 2015EA000110.
- Fromm, M., G. Kablick, G. Nedoluha, E. Carboni, R. Grainger, J. Campbell, and J. Lewis (2014),
 Correcting the record of volcanic stratospheric aerosol impact: Nabro and Sarychev Peak, Journal
 of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 119(17), 10,343-310,364.
- Fyfe, J. C., N. P. Gillett, and F. W. Zwiers (2013a), Overestimated global warming over the past 20 years, Nature Clim. Change, 3(9), 767-769.
- Fyfe, J. C., K. von Salzen, J. N. S. Cole, N. P. Gillett, and J. P. Vernier (2013b), Surface response to
 stratospheric aerosol changes in a coupled atmosphere–ocean model, Geophysical Research
 Letters, 40(3), 584-588.
- Ge, C., J. Wang, S. Carn, K. Yang, P. Ginoux, and N. Krotkov (2016), Satellite-based global
 volcanic SO2 emissions and sulfate direct radiative forcing during 2005–2012, Journal of
 Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 121(7), 2015JD023134.

- Gettelman, A., X. Liu, D. Barahona, U. Lohmann, and C. Chen (2012), Climate impacts of ice
 nucleation, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 117(D20).
- Gettelman, A., X. Liu, S. J. Ghan, H. Morrison, S. Park, A. J. Conley, S. A. Klein, J. Boyle, D. L.
 Mitchell, and J. L. F. Li (2010), Global simulations of ice nucleation and ice supersaturation with
 an improved cloud scheme in the Community Atmosphere Model, Journal of Geophysical
 Research: Atmospheres, 115(D18), D18216.
- Ghan, S. J. (2013), Technical Note: Estimating aerosol effects on cloud radiative forcing, Atmos.
 Chem. Phys., 13(19), 9971-9974.
- Ghan, S. J., X. Liu, R. C. Easter, R. Zaveri, P. Rasch, J.-H. Yoon, and B. Eaton (2012), Toward a
 Minimal Representation of Aerosols in Climate Models: Comparative Decomposition of Aerosol
 Direct, Semidirect, and Indirect Radiative Forcing, Journal of Climate, 25(19), 6461-6476.
- Gregory, J. M. (2010), Long-term effect of volcanic forcing on ocean heat content, Geophysical
 Research Letters, 37(22), L22701.
- Gregory, J. M., T. Andrews, P. Good, T. Mauritsen, and P. M. Forster (2016), Small global-mean
 cooling due to volcanic radiative forcing, Clim Dyn, 1-13.
- Gregory, J. M., D. Bi, M. A. Collier, M. R. Dix, A. C. Hirst, A. Hu, M. Huber, R. Knutti, S. J.
 Marsland, M. Meinshausen, H. A. Rashid, L. D. Rotstayn, A. Schurer, and J. A. Church (2013),
 Climate models without preindustrial volcanic forcing underestimate historical ocean thermal
 expansion, Geophysical Research Letters, 40(8), 1600-1604.
- Hansen, J., R. Ruedy, M. Sato, and K. Lo (2010), Global surface temperature change, Reviews of
 Geophysics, 48(4), RG4004.
- Hansen, J., M. Sato, R. Ruedy, L. Nazarenko, A. Lacis, G. A. Schmidt, G. Russell, I. Aleinov, M.
 Bauer, S. Bauer, N. Bell, B. Cairns, V. Canuto, M. Chandler, Y. Cheng, A. Del Genio, G.
 Faluvegi, E. Fleming, A. Friend, T. Hall, C. Jackman, M. Kelley, N. Kiang, D. Koch, J. Lean, J.
 Lerner, K. Lo, S. Menon, R. Miller, P. Minnis, T. Novakov, V. Oinas, J. Perlwitz, J. Perlwitz, D.
 Rind, A. Romanou, D. Shindell, P. Stone, S. Sun, N. Tausnev, D. Thresher, B. Wielicki, T. Wong,
 M. Yao, and S. Zhang (2005), Efficacy of climate forcings, Journal of Geophysical Research:
 Atmospheres, 110(D18), D18104.
- Haywood, J. M., A. Jones, and G. S. Jones (2014), The impact of volcanic eruptions in the period
 2000–2013 on global mean temperature trends evaluated in the HadGEM2-ES climate model,
 Atmospheric Science Letters, 15(2), 92-96.
- Huber, M., and R. Knutti (2014), Natural variability, radiative forcing and climate response in the
 recent hiatus reconciled, Nature Geoscience, 7, 651.
- Hurrell, J. W., J. J. Hack, D. Shea, J. M. Caron, and J. Rosinski (2008), A New Sea Surface
 Temperature and Sea Ice Boundary Dataset for the Community Atmosphere Model, Journal of
 Climate, 21(19), 5145-5153.
- IPCC (2013), Annex II: Climate System Scenario Tables in Climate Change 2013: The Physical
 Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the
 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, edited by T. F. Stocker, D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M.
 Tignor, S. K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P. M. Midgley, pp. 1395–1446,
 Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA.
- Jensen, E. J., and O. B. Toon (1992), The potential effects of volcanic aerosols on cirrus cloud microphysics, Geophys. Res. Lett., 19(6)(17), 1759-1762.
- Karl, T. R., A. Arguez, B. Huang, J. H. Lawrimore, J. R. McMahon, M. J. Menne, T. C. Peterson, R.
 S. Vose, and H.-M. Zhang (2015), Possible artifacts of data biases in the recent global surface
 warming hiatus, Science, 348(6242), 1469-1472.
- Kooperman, G. J., M. S. Pritchard, S. J. Ghan, M. Wang, R. C. J. Somerville, and L. M. Russell
 (2012), Constraining the influence of natural variability to improve estimates of global aerosol
 indirect effects in a nudged version of the Community Atmosphere Model 5, Journal of
 Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 117(D23), D23204.
- Kravitz, B., and A. Robock (2011), Climate effects of high-latitude volcanic eruptions: Role of the
 time of year, J. Geophys. Res., 116(D1), D01105.
- Kuebbeler, M., U. Lohmann, and J. Feichter (2012), Effects of stratospheric sulfate aerosol geoengineering on cirrus clouds, Geophysical Research Letters, 39(23).
- Lacis, A. (2015), Volcanic aerosol radiative properties, PAGES, 23(2), 50-51.
- Lacis, A., J. Hansen, and M. Sato (1992), Climate Forcing by Stratospheric Aerosols, Geophys. Res.
 Lett., 19(6)(15), 1607-1610.

- Larson, E. J. L., and R. W. Portmann (2016), A Temporal Kernel Method to Compute Effective
 Radiative Forcing in CMIP5 Transient Simulations, Journal of Climate, 29(4), 1497-1509.
- Loeb, N. G., S. Kato, W. Su, T. Wong, F. G. Rose, D. R. Doelling, J. R. Norris, and X. Huang
 (2012), Advances in Understanding Top-of-Atmosphere Radiation Variability from Satellite
 Observations, Surveys in Geophysics, 33(3), 359-385.
- Loeb, N. G., D. R. Doelling, H. Wang, W. Su, C. Nguyen, J. G. Corbett, L. Liang, C. Mitrescu, F. G.
 Rose, and S. Kato (2017), Clouds and the Earth's Radiant Energy System (CERES) Energy
 Balanced and Filled (EBAF) Top-of-Atmosphere (TOA) Edition-4.0 Data Product, Journal of
 Climate, 31(2), 895-918.
- Lohmann, U., B. Kärcher, and C. Timmreck (2003), Impact of the Mount Pinatubo eruption on cirrus
 clouds formed by homogeneous freezing in the ECHAM4 GCM, Journal of Geophysical
 Research: Atmospheres, 108(D18).
- Luo, Z., W. B. Rossow, T. Inoue, and C. J. Stubenrauch (2002), Did the Eruption of the Mt. Pinatubo
 Volcano Affect Cirrus Properties?, Journal of Climate, 15(19), 2806-2820.
- Marotzke, J., and P. M. Forster (2015), Forcing, feedback and internal variability in global
 temperature trends, Nature, 517(7536), 565-570.
- Meinshausen, M., S. J. Smith, K. Calvin, J. S. Daniel, M. L. T. Kainuma, J.-F. Lamarque, K.
 Matsumoto, S. A. Montzka, S. C. B. Raper, K. Riahi, A. Thomson, G. J. M. Velders, and D. P. P.
 van Vuuren (2011), The RCP greenhouse gas concentrations and their extensions from 1765 to
 2300, Climatic Change, 109(1), 213.
- Mills, M. J., A. Schmidt, R. Easter, S. Solomon, D. E. Kinnison, S. J. Ghan, R. R. Neely, D. R.
 Marsh, A. Conley, C. G. Bardeen, and A. Gettelman (2016), Global volcanic aerosol properties
 derived from emissions, 1990–2014, using CESM1(WACCM), Journal of Geophysical Research:
 Atmospheres, 121(5), 2015JD024290.
- Mills, M. J., J. H. Richter, S. Tilmes, B. Kravitz, D. G. MacMartin, A. A. Glanville, J. J. Tribbia, J.F. Lamarque, F. Vitt, A. Schmidt, A. Gettelman, C. Hannay, J. T. Bacmeister, and D. E. Kinnison
 (2017), Radiative and Chemical Response to Interactive Stratospheric Sulfate Aerosols in Fully
 Coupled CESM1(WACCM), Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 122(23), 13,061013,078.
- Minnis, P., E. F. Harrison, L. L. Stowe, G. G. Gibson, F. M. Denn, D. R. Doelling, and W. L. Smith (1993), Radiative Climate Forcing by the Mount Pinatubo Eruption, Science, 259(5100), 1411-1415.
- Monerie, P.-A., M.-P. Moine, L. Terray, and S. Valcke (2017), Quantifying the impact of early 21st
 century volcanic eruptions on global-mean surface temperature, Environmental Research Letters,
 12(5), 054010.
- Morice, C. P., J. J. Kennedy, N. A. Rayner, and P. D. Jones (2012), Quantifying uncertainties in global and regional temperature change using an ensemble of observational estimates: The HadCRUT4 data set, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 117(D8), D08101.
- Morrison, H., and A. Gettelman (2008), A New Two-Moment Bulk Stratiform Cloud Microphysics
 Scheme in the Community Atmosphere Model, Version 3 (CAM3). Part I: Description and
 Numerical Tests, Journal of Climate, 21(15), 3642-3659.
- Myhre, G., D. Shindell, F.-M. Bréon, W. Collins, J. Fuglestvedt, J. Huang, D. Koch, J.-F. Lamarque,
 D. Lee, B. Mendoza, T. Nakajima, A. Robock, G. Stephens, T. Takemura, and H. Zhang (2013),
 Anthropogenic and Natural Radiative Forcing, in Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science
 Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental
 Panel on Climate Change, edited by T. F. Stocker, D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S. K. Allen,
 J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P. M. Midgley, pp. 659–740, Cambridge University
 Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA.
- Neely, R. R., and A. Schmidt (2016), VolcanEESM: Global volcanic sulphur dioxide (SO2)
 emissions database from 1850 to present Version 1.0., Centre for Environmental Data Analysis.
- Newhall, C. G., and S. Self (1982), The Volcanic Explosivity Index (VEI) An Estimate of Explosive
 Magnitude for Historical Volcanism, J. Geophys. Res., 87(C2), 1231-1238.
- 869 NOAA (2016a), AGGI, edited.
- 870 NOAA (2016b), ONI, edited.
- O'Neill, B. C., C. Tebaldi, D. P. van Vuuren, V. Eyring, P. Friedlingstein, G. Hurtt, R. Knutti, E.
 Kriegler, J. F. Lamarque, J. Lowe, G. A. Meehl, R. Moss, K. Riahi, and B. M. Sanderson (2016),

- The Scenario Model Intercomparison Project (ScenarioMIP) for CMIP6, Geosci. Model Dev.,
 9(9), 3461-3482.
- Pyle, D. M. (1995), Mass and energy budgets of explosive volcanic eruptions, Geophysical Research
 Letters, 22(5), 563-566.
- Ridley, D. A., S. Solomon, J. E. Barnes, V. D. Burlakov, T. Deshler, S. I. Dolgii, A. B. Herber, T.
 Nagai, R. R. Neely, A. V. Nevzorov, C. Ritter, T. Sakai, B. D. Santer, M. Sato, A. Schmidt, O.
 Uchino, and J. P. Vernier (2014), Total volcanic stratospheric aerosol optical depths and
 implications for global climate change, Geophysical Research Letters, 41(22), 2014GL061541.
- Rienecker, M. M., M. J. Suarez, R. Gelaro, R. Todling, Julio Bacmeister, E. Liu, M. G. Bosilovich,
 S. D. Schubert, L. Takacs, G.-K. Kim, S. Bloom, J. Chen, D. Collins, A. Conaty, A. d. Silva, W.
 Gu, J. Joiner, R. D. Koster, R. Lucchesi, A. Molod, T. Owens, S. Pawson, P. Pegion, C. R.
 Redder, R. Reichle, F. R. Robertson, A. G. Ruddick, M. Sienkiewicz, and J. Woollen (2011),
 MERRA: NASA's Modern-Era Retrospective Analysis for Research and Applications, Journal of
 Climate, 24(14), 3624-3648.
- Roscoe, H. K. (2001), The Risk of Large Volcanic Eruptions and the Impact of this Risk on Future
 Ozone Depletion, Nat Hazards, 23(2), 231-246.
- Santer, B. D., C. Bonfils, J. F. Painter, M. D. Zelinka, C. Mears, S. Solomon, G. A. Schmidt, J. C.
 Fyfe, J. N. S. Cole, L. Nazarenko, K. E. Taylor, and F. J. Wentz (2014), Volcanic contribution to
 decadal changes in tropospheric temperature, Nature Geosci, 7(3), 185-189.
- Sassen, K. (1992), Evidence for Liquid-Phase Cirrus Cloud Formation from Volcanic Aerosols:
 Climatic Implications, Science, 257(5069), 516-519.
- Sato, M., J. E. Hansen, M. P. McCormick, and J. B. Pollack (1993), Stratospheric aerosol optical
 depths, 1850–1990, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 98(D12), 22987-22994.
- Schmidt, G. A., D. T. Shindell, and K. Tsigaridis (2014), Reconciling warming trends, Nature Geosci, 7(3), 158-160.
- Solomon, S., J. S. Daniel, R. R. Neely, J.-P. Vernier, E. G. Dutton, and L. W. Thomason (2011), The
 Persistently Variable "Background" Stratospheric Aerosol Layer and Global Climate Change,
 Science, 333(6044), 866-870.
- Solomon, S., D. J. Ivy, D. Kinnison, M. J. Mills, R. R. Neely, and A. Schmidt (2016), Emergence of
 healing in the Antarctic ozone layer, Science, 353, 269-274.
- Thomason, L. W., N. Ernest, L. Millán, L. Rieger, A. Bourassa, J. P. Vernier, G. Manney, B. Luo, F.
 Arfeuille, and T. Peter (2018), A global space-based stratospheric aerosol climatology: 1979–2016, Earth Syst. Sci. Data, 10(1), 469-492.
- Timmreck, C., G. W. Mann, V. Aquila, R. Hommel, L. A. Lee, A. Schmidt, C. Brühl, S. Carn, M.
 Chin, S. S. Dhomse, T. Diehl, J. M. English, M. J. Mills, R. Neely, J. Sheng, M. Toohey, and D.
 Weisenstein (2018), The Interactive Stratospheric Aerosol Model Intercomparison Project (ISAMIP): motivation and experimental design, Geosci. Model Dev., 11(7), 2581-2608.
- Toohey, M., K. Krüger, U. Niemeier, and C. Timmreck (2011), The influence of eruption season on
 the global aerosol evolution and radiative impact of tropical volcanic eruptions, Atmos. Chem.
 Phys., 11(23), 12351-12367.
- 913 Trenberth, K. E., and J. T. Fasullo (2013), An apparent hiatus in global warming?, Earth's Future,
 914 1(1), 19-32.
- 915 Vernier, J. P., L. W. Thomason, J. P. Pommereau, A. Bourassa, J. Pelon, A. Garnier, A.
 916 Hauchecorne, L. Blanot, C. Trepte, D. Degenstein, and F. Vargas (2011), Major influence of
 917 tropical volcanic eruptions on the stratospheric aerosol layer during the last decade, Geophysical
 918 Research Letters, 38(12), L12807.
- Visioni, D., G. Pitari, and G. di Genova (2018), Upper tropospheric ice sensitivity to sulfate
 geoengineering, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 2018, 1-37.
- Zhang, K., H. Wan, X. Liu, S. J. Ghan, G. J. Kooperman, P. L. Ma, P. J. Rasch, D. Neubauer, and U.
 Lohmann (2014), Technical Note: On the use of nudging for aerosol-climate model
 intercomparison studies, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 14(16), 8631-8645.

Figure 1.



CMIP6 and CESM1(WACCM) nudged-uv monthly global-mean SAOD at 550nm

Figure 2.



Figure 3.



ERBS and CESM1(WACCM) global mean radiative flux anomalies

Figure 4.



Nudged-uv SW and LW volcanic forcings diagnosed in CESM1(WACCM)

Figure 5.



Change in monthly global-mean in-cloud ice crystal effective radius / μm

Figure 6.



Nudged-uv regression of volcanic forcing against SAOD

Figure 7.

Global-mean surface temperature response

