The contrast between Atlantic and Pacific surface water fluxes

Philip M. Craig *

DAVID FERREIRA

John Methven

Department of Meteorology, University of Reading, Reading, Berkshire, UK

October 14, 2016

* Corresponding author email address:

p.m.craig@pgr.reading.ac.uk

3

4

Abstract

5

The Atlantic Ocean is known to have higher sea surface salinity than the 6 Pacific Ocean at all latitudes. This is thought to be associated with the 7 Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation and deep water formation in 8 the high latitude North Atlantic - a phenomenon not present anywhere 9 in the Pacific. This asymmetry may be a result of salt transport in the 10 ocean or an asymmetry in the surface water flux (evaporation minus pre-11 cipitation; E - P) with greater E - P over the Atlantic than the Pacific. 12 In this paper we focus on the surface water flux. 13

Seven estimates of the net freshwater flux (E - P - R including14 runoff, R), calculated with different methods and a range of data sources 15 (atmospheric and oceanic reanalyses, surface flux datasets, hydrographic 16 sections), are compared. It is shown that E - P - R over the Atlantic is 17 consistently greater than E - P - R over the Pacific by about 0.4 Sv (1 18 $Sv \equiv 10^6 \text{ m}^3 \text{ s}^{-1}$). The Atlantic/Pacific E - P - R asymmetry is found at 19 all latitudes between 30°S and 60°N. Further analysis with ERA-Interim 20 combined with a runoff dataset demonstrates that the basin E – P – 21 R asymmetry is dominated by an evaporation asymmetry in the north-22 ern high-latitudes, but by a precipitation asymmetry everywhere south 23 of 30°N. At the basin scale, the excess of precipitation over the Pacific 24

compared to the Atlantic (~ 30° S - 60° N) dominates the asymmetry. 25 Also it is shown that the asymmetry is present throughout the year and 26 quite steady from year to year. Investigation of the interannual variabil-27 ity and trends suggest that the precipitation trends are not robust be-28 tween datasets and are indistinguishable from variability. However, a pos-29 itive trend in evaporation (comparable to other published estimates) is 30 seen in ERA-Interim, consistent with sea surface temperature increases. 31 Key words: evaporation, precipitation, runoff, moisture flux, salinity, 32 freshwater transport, Meridional Overturning Circulation 33

34 1 Introduction

The Atlantic Ocean is known to have higher sea surface salinity (SSS) 35 than the Pacific Ocean at all latitudes. In the northern hemisphere, dif-36 ferences of up to 2 psu (practical salinity units) are present in the sub-37 tropical gyres (Gordon *et al.*, 2015) and at high latitudes, with the dif-38 ference reduced to 1 psu in the southern hemisphere subtropical gyres 39 (Fig. 1a). Salinity patterns are linked to the hydrological cycle (Schmitt, 40 2008) with regions of high SSS corresponding to regions of positive E-P41 (evaporation minus precipitation) and regions of low SSS corresponding 42 to regions of negative E - P (Fig. 1b). Some authors have attemped 43 to use SSS as a "rain gauge" for the ocean (Ren et al., 2014) and others 44 have investigated how SSS has changed with the intensification of the hy-45 drological cycle in recent decades (Skliris et al., 2014). Durack and Wijf-46 fels (2010) found that the contrast in SSS between the Atlantic and Pa-47 cific has increased from 1950-2008, consistent with an intensified hydro-48 logical cycle expected from global warming conditions (Held and Soden, 49 2006). 50

The high salinity in the high latitude North Atlantic is associated with deep water formation through deep convection in the Greenland and Labrador Seas and a deep Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circu-

lation (AMOC) (Marshall and Schott, 1999). There is no such deep con-54 vection in the North Pacific as SSS is too low for sinking to occur (War-55 ren, 1983) and the Meridonal Overturning Circulation there is wind-driven 56 and confined to the upper ocean. Various reasons have been put forward 57 to explain the asymmetry in MOC, such as differences in basin geome-58 try (Schmitt et al., 1989; Ferreira et al., 2010; Nilsson et al., 2013), the 59 configuration of mountain ranges (Schmittner et al., 2011; Sinha et al., 60 2012), interbasin salt fluxes (Weijer et al., 1999) and the existence of mul-61 tiple equilibria of the MOC (Huisman *et al.*, 2009) – see also the review 62 by Weaver *et al.* (1999). In nearly all published hypotheses not involving 63 multiple equilibria, the net surface water flux (evaporation minus precip-64 itation; E - P) is a key element, either as a cause or as a consequence of 65 the MOC asymmetry. Indeed, it seems natural that the larger net evapo-66 ration (E - P > 0) in the Atlantic than in the Pacific (well noted in the 67 literature, at least for high-latitudes) should be part of any theory for the 68 MOC and SSS asymmetry between basins. 69

Warren (1983) pointed out that the Pacific has a lower evaporation rate compared to the Atlantic at high latitudes. He also investigated the effect of the line of zero wind stress curl on salt advection into the northern North Atlantic and Pacific, and suggested that the tilted Atlantic zero wind stress curl line allowed for more salt advection than in the Pa-

cific from the high salinity subtropics. Using updated datasets, Emile-75 Geay et al. (2003) drew a similar conclusion. They further suggested that 76 moisture transport associated with the Asian monsoon could contribute 77 to the freshening of the subpolar North Pacific (no such transport ex-78 ists over the subpolar North Atlantic) although no quantification of this 79 effect was offered. Revisiting the idea of Warren (1983), Czaja (2009) 80 found that the tilted zero wind stress curl line coincides with the line 81 separating net evaporation from net precipitation (E - P < 0) in the 82 Atlantic but not the Pacific. Higher subopolar salinity in the Atlantic 83 can therefore be maintained more easily in the Atlantic than in the Pa-84 cific. Czaja (2009) also investigated the temporal behaviour of the North 85 Atlantic and North Pacific jet streams, finding the North Atlantic to be 86 more variable, a feature which is efficient at driving salt advection into 87 the subpolar gyre. 88

The higher subpolar North Atlantic mean evaporation rate noted by Warren (1983), Emile-Geay *et al.* (2003) and Wills and Schneider (2015) was attributed to higher Atlantic sea surface temperatures (SSTs). The colder Pacific SSTs were explained by Warren (1983) to be a result of cold upwelling in the subpolar North Pacific. However, Czaja (2009) argued that the higher subpolar Atlantic evaporation is simply a positive feedback: the higher rate of evaporation is caused by higher SSTs which

is a result of the enhanced northward ocean heat transport (Trenberth 96 and Caron, 2001) by the AMOC. Wills and Schneider (2015) found that 97 atmospheric transient eddies and stationary-eddy vertical motion are dom-98 inant terms in setting zonal variations in the surface water flux for sub-99 polar North Atlantic and Pacific. Transient eddies freshen the subpolar 100 North Pacific (while salinifying the subpolar North Atlantic) because the 101 Pacific storm track covers a larger area. Stationary-eddy vertical mo-102 tion freshens the subpolar North Pacific more than the subpolar North 103 Atlantic due to poleward motion and surface stress associated with the 104 Aleutian low and subtropical high. The arguments of Wills and Schnei-105 der (2015) are linked to the relative width of the subpolar basins high-106 lighted by Schmitt *et al.* (1989): the Atlantic is narrower so a greater 107 fraction of it is affected by dry air coming off the downstream continent, 108 thus the area-averaged evaporation rate is stronger. 109

¹¹⁰ Many previous studies have focused on the E - P asymmetry be-¹¹¹ tween the far northern regions of both oceans, although Rahmstorf (1996) ¹¹² focused on the positive Atlantic E - P north of 30°S. It is unclear where ¹¹³ E - P is the critical quantity since the SSS asymmetry between the basins ¹¹⁴ exists at all latitudes. In addition, discussion of the E - P asymmetry ¹¹⁵ has often been framed, implicitly or explicitly, as an asymmetry in evap-¹¹⁶ oration, neglecting the possible roles for precipitation and runoff.

7

In this paper we aim to answer the following questions:

118 1. How robust is the Pacific/Atlantic E - P - R asymmetry across 119 datasets?

2. Is the Pacific/Atlantic asymmetry present at all latitudes?

¹²¹ 3. Is the E - P - R asymmetry mainly due to an asymmetry in evapo-¹²² ration, precipitation or runoff?

4. Can interannual variability of E - P be attributed to interannual variability in evaporation or precipitation?

To address these questions, we will compare various published fresh-125 water flux estimates obtained with a range of methods. Importantly, we 126 will show that E - P from ERA-Interim (estimated using vertically inte-127 grated atmospheric moisture flux divergence or the forecast model E and 128 P fields) combined with an independent estimate of R agree well with 129 other estimates from both oceanic and atmospheric data. This step gives 130 us ground to further explore the ERA-Interim E and P fields separately 131 and address questions 3 and 4 above. 132

The budget calculations (for the atmosphere and ocean) used to compute the net surface water flux (E - P) and net freshwater flux (E - P)P - R) are summarized in section 2. A brief description of the selected datasets is given in section 3. These estimates are compared in section
4. In section 5, annual means, seasonal cycles and interannual variability
of the evaporation and precipitation from ERA-Interim are discussed in
the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans. Conclusions will be drawn in section 6.
Note that, for completeness, results for the Indian Ocean are also shown
but that our discussion largely focuses on the Atlantic and Pacific basins.

¹⁴² 2 Budget Framework

This section describes the methods used to calculate the surface water flux from atmospheric data (section 2.1) and the net freshwater flux from oceanic data (sections 2.2 and 2.3). It should be noted that, although similar in spirit, these calculations use completely different inputs (wind and specific humidity on one side, temperature and salinity on the other) and yet, as will be demonstrated in section 4, they give remarkably similar results.

¹⁵⁰ 2.1 Atmospheric moisture budget

In the atmosphere evaporation minus precipitation (e - p), where e and p are rates at grid points), can be related to the vertical integral of the ¹⁵³ mass continuity equation for water vapour (Berrisford *et al.*, 2011):

$$e - p = \frac{\partial TCWV}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \frac{1}{g} \int_0^1 \mathbf{u} q \frac{\partial \tilde{p}}{\partial \eta} \mathrm{d}\eta \tag{1}$$

where $TCWV = \frac{1}{g} \int_0^1 q \frac{\partial \tilde{p}}{\partial \eta} d\eta$ is the total column water vapour, g is gravi-154 tational acceleration, **u** is the velocity vector, q is specific humidity and \tilde{p} 155 is pressure. The second term on the right-hand side of eq. (1) is the ver-156 tically integrated moisture flux divergence (denoted $\operatorname{div}\mathbf{Q}$ hereafter, here 157 written in terms of η the terrain-following hybrid pressure co-ordinate 158 used in the ERA-Interim reanalysis where $\eta = 1$ represents the surface 159 and $\eta = 0$ represents the top of the atmosphere). Ice and liquid water are 160 neglected as their mass transports are small when compared to those of 161 water vapour (Berrisford *et al.*, 2011). 162

Integrated over long timescales, div**Q** approximately balances e - p163 (Trenberth *et al.*, 2011) since the tendency term (first term on the right-164 hand side of eq. (1)) is orders of magnitude smaller than divQ and E – 165 P. The annual mean ERA-Interim (1979-2014) div \mathbf{Q} over the global oceans 166 is shown in Fig. 1(b). As expected, moisture flux divergence implying 167 net evaporation is found in the subtropics and convergence implying net 168 precipitation is found in the Intertropical Convergence Zone (ITCZ) and 169 in mid- to high-latitudes. Note the clear correspondence between the e – 170 p and SSS patterns: the regions of positive (negative) e - p in Fig.1(b) 171

correspond approximately to regions of high (low) salinity in (a). The 172 subtropical gyres occupy regions of high SSS and e - p with the highest 173 open ocean SSS found in the North Atlantic subtropical gyre (D'Addezio 174 and Bingham, 2014). Salinity minima are found slightly to the north of 175 the ITCZ (e - p minima) in both the Atlantic and Pacific due to north-176 wards Ekman transport of salt (Tchilibou *et al.*, 2015). The salinity min-177 imum caused by the South Pacific Convergence Zone (SPCZ) is also off-178 set from the e - p minimum due to Ekman transport. 179

180 2.2 Mass transport in the ocean

¹⁸¹ The net freshwater flux (E - P - R) can be estimated by completely ¹⁸² independent means from oceanographic data alone. Consider the integral ¹⁸³ of the the mass continuity equation for the ocean over a fixed volume V ¹⁸⁴ between latitudes ϕ_N and ϕ_S and from the western to eastern boundaries ¹⁸⁵ of an ocean basin:

where $M = \iiint_V \rho dV$, ∂V is the boundary of the volume and **n** is the outward-facing normal vector. Assuming steady state, eq. (2) can be rewritten as:

$$P - E + R = \iint_{\phi_N} \rho \mathbf{u} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{n}} \, \mathrm{d}x \mathrm{d}z - \iint_{\phi_S} \rho \mathbf{u} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{n}} \, \mathrm{d}x \mathrm{d}z \tag{3}$$

where $\tilde{\mathbf{n}}$ is the northward-pointing normal vector. This simply states that the difference between the flux across two longitude-height sections is equal to the net (integrated) input of water at the ocean's surface between the sections, $P - E = \iint_{\text{surf}} (p - e) dx dy$ (e and p as in eq. (1)), plus runoff R into the ocean basin. The latter is effectively the integrated flux across the western and eastern boundaries.

¹⁹⁵ 2.3 Oceanographic method to estimate freshwater transport

The mass balance equation (3) allows the calculation of P - E + R from 196 the mass fluxes through two sections. This method can be applied pre-197 cisely in a General Circulation Model where the velocity field is known 198 with high accuracy. On hydrographic sections, however, temperature, 199 salinity and other tracers are measured at a range of depths at locations 200 along a ship's route, but velocities are not. Horizontal velocities are esti-201 mated from thermal wind balance and determination of a reference veloc-202 ity. Uncertainties in this method are so large that a direct estimation of 203 E - P - R from the mass balance eq. (3) is impractical on hydrographic 204 sections. The uncertainty in estimates of E - P - R can be significantly 205 reduced by combining the mass balance with the salinity balance (Wijf-206 fels, 2001; Ganachaud and Wunsch, 2003; Talley, 2008). 207

208

Integration of the salt budget over a fixed volume, assuming that

²⁰⁹ any sources of salt are negligible (Wijffels *et al.*, 1992), gives:

where the mass of salt $M_s = \iiint_V \rho s dV$ with salinity s. In steady state, eq. (4) becomes

$$\iint_{\phi_N} \rho s \mathbf{u} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{n}} \, \mathrm{d}x \mathrm{d}z - \iint_{\phi_S} \rho s \mathbf{u} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{n}} \, \mathrm{d}x \mathrm{d}z = 0. \tag{5}$$

The mass and salt balances, eqs. (3) and (5), can be combined using a reference salinity s_0 to re-scale the salt budget:

$$P - E + R = \iint_{\phi_N} \left(1 - \frac{s}{s_0} \right) \rho \mathbf{u} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{n}} \, \mathrm{d}x \mathrm{d}z - \iint_{\phi_S} \left(1 - \frac{s}{s_0} \right) \rho \mathbf{u} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{n}} \, \mathrm{d}x \mathrm{d}z.$$
(6)

This equation uses two observed properties (temperature and salinity) from hydrographic sections. As pointed out by Ganachaud and Wunsch (2003), uncertainties associated with estimation of P - E + R (eq. (6)) are about one order of magnitude lower than attempting to estimate the same quantity directly from (3). Note also that, in practice, the choice of s_0 has little impact on the freshwater transport estimates (Talley, 2008).

When using eq. (6), the northern section is often set at the Bering Strait and the expression is approximated assuming a uniform salinity s_{BS} across the strait, yielding:

$$P - E + R = T_{\rm BS} \left(1 - \frac{s_{\rm BS}}{s_0} \right) - \iint_{\phi_S} \left(1 - \frac{s}{s_0} \right) \rho \mathbf{u} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{n}} \, \mathrm{d}x \mathrm{d}z \tag{7}$$

where $T_{\rm BS}$ is the net (northward) mass transport across the Bering Strait. Note that for a south section ϕ_S in the Pacific, $T_{\rm BS}$ is positive (i.e. northward/outward of the domain defined by the two sections), but is negative for in the Atlantic (i.e. inward flux into the domain). The first term on the right-hand side of eq. (7) is sometimes referred to as the Bering Strait "leakage".

Variants of eq. (6) (or eq. (7)) are found in the literature. Wijffels
(2001) sets the reference salinity equal to the mean salinity along each
section and works with the salinity anomalies about the mean salinity.
Wijffels *et al.* (1992) do not use a reference salinity when combining the
mass and salt budgets, but rather express the salinity in kg of salt per kg
of water:

$$(P - E + R) = \iint_{\phi_N} (1 - s)\rho \mathbf{u} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{n}} \, \mathrm{d}x \mathrm{d}z - \iint_{\phi_S} (1 - s)\rho \mathbf{u} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{n}} \, \mathrm{d}x \mathrm{d}z \qquad (8)$$

defining a true freshwater transport *i.e.* the part of the ocean transport which is "fresh". However, eq. (8) is heavily weighted towards the mass balance since $s \sim 0.035 \ll 1$, and so this method has the same limitations as the pure mass balance eq. (3).

239 **3** Datasets

We compare estimates of E - P - R (*i.e.* positive into the atmosphere) 240 from seven different datasets. We do not aim to be exhaustive in our choice, 241 but rather to include a range of methods available for such computations 242 at the global scale. Importantly, these estimates include methods rely-243 ing nearly exclusively on atmospheric or oceanographic data, while other 244 methods combine measurements from both fluids. Note that Wijffels *et al.* 245 (1992) calculated the first global distribution of freshwater transport us-246 ing the results of Baumgartner and Reichel (1975) for E, P and R in 5° 247 latitude bands. However, this estimate produced a strongly negative value 248 of E - P - R for the Pacific. This was shown by Wijffels (2001) to be in-249 correct: it is likely the result of poor or sparse observations from Baum-250 gartner and Reichel (1975). Estimates from Wijffels *et al.* (1992) will there-251 fore not be discussed further. 252

253 3.1 Atmospheric reanalysis

²⁵⁴ We use monthly mean data from the ERA-Interim reanalysis dataset from ²⁵⁵ the ECMWF (European Centre for Medium-Range Weather Forecasts) ²⁵⁶ for the years 1979-2014 (Dee *et al.*, 2011). The data are on a full N128 ²⁵⁷ Gaussian grid at $0.75^{\circ} \times 0.75^{\circ}$ horizonal resolution and with 60 vertical levels. ERA-Interim uses a 4D-VAR data assimilation scheme with
12-hourly analysis cycles which combine observations with prior information from the model. Pressure level parameters are provided every 6
hours and surface parameters are provided every 3 hours.

ERA-Interim allows for E - P to be calculated in two ways: from 262 $\operatorname{div}\mathbf{Q}$ using eq. (1) and from separate evaporation and precipitation fields 263 which are output as the accumulated (time-integrated) fluxes at the lower 264 boundary over each forecast. In the reanalysis system the forecasts are 265 restarted every 12 hours from the previous analysis. Many studies have 266 used div \mathbf{Q} to calculate E - P (e.g. Seager and Henderson, 2013; Brown 267 and Kummerow, 2014) but Berrisford *et al.* (2011) points out that the 268 difference between divQ and E-P from the forecast model is small when 269 averaged globally so when E - P is integrated over an ocean basin only a 270 small difference should be expected between the $\operatorname{div}\mathbf{Q}$ and forecast model 271 calculations. Here, values of E - P (divQ) from ERA-Interim will be 272 combined with run-off estimates R from Dai and Trenberth (2002) (see 273 below). 274

Dai and Trenberth (2003) estimated freshwater transports using P-*E* from ECMWF (1979-1993) and NCEP/NCAR (1979-1995) reanalyses along with improved estimates of *R* from Dai and Trenberth (2002). These improved estimates of *R* were calculated from streamflow data for

the world's 921 largest rivers at the furthest downstream gauge station 279 which were then extrapolated to the river mouth. By extrapolating to 280 the river mouth total global runoff was increased by 19% compared to 281 previous datasets. By using reanalysis P - E and the new R dataset 282 (along with the same transport of 0.794 Sv (1 Sv $\equiv 10^6 \,\mathrm{m^3 \, s^{-1}}$) as used 283 by Wijffels *et al.* (1992) at the Bering Strait), Dai and Trenberth (2003) 284 showed that the southward freshwater transport at all latitudes in the 285 Atlantic and northward transport in the South Pacific are stronger than 286 shown by Wijffels *et al.* (1992). 287

288 3.2 Independent estimates of e and p

The oceanic freshwater budget was quantified by Schanze *et al.* (2010)289 using atmospheric data from independent sources for surface freshwater 290 fluxes. GPCP (Global Precipitation Climatology Project, Adler et al., 291 2003) was used for precipitation and OAFlux (Objectively Analyzed air-292 sea Fluxes; Yu and Weller, 2007) for evaporation for the period 1987-293 2006, with the Dai and Trenberth (2002) runoff. Freshwater transports 294 were estimated by integrating e - p - r meridionally over each basin. 295 A transport of 0.8 Sv is used at the Bering Strait and iceberg forcings of 296 0.01 and 0.06 Sv are added near Greenland and Antarctica respectively. 297 This method leaves an imbalance of 0.32 Sv at 55° S which could not be 298

²⁹⁹ constrained to a particular basin.

300 3.3 Hydrographic sections

Ganachaud and Wunsch (2003) used geostrophic inverse box modeling 301 on hydrographic sections from the World Ocean Circulation Experiment 302 (WOCE) to estimate E - P - R from ocean transports using eq. (6). 303 The model used determines a high-resolution geostrophic velocity field to 304 ensure that the circulation allows for near-conservation of mass, heat and 305 salt. Four sections were used in both the Atlantic and Pacific and three 306 used in the Indian Ocean. The Indonesian Througflow (ITF) transport 307 was 15 ± 5 Sv from the 1989 JADE section (Ganachaud *et al.*, 2000). 308 Note that using data from hydrographic sections has the effect of alias-309 ing ocean variability as each section was recorded in a different month 310 and/or a different year. For complete details of the routes and dates of 311 each section see Fig. 1 in Ganachaud and Wunsch (2003). 312

Talley (2008) used absolute geostrophic velocity analyses from hydrographic sections by J. Reid, combined with Ekman transports using NCEP reanalysis winds to estimate freshwater transports using eq. (7). Geostrophic reference velocities were adjusted to ensure mass balance through each section. A reference salinity of $s_o = 34.9$ g/kg was used and the transports through the Bering Strait and the ITF were set to 1 ³¹⁹ Sv and 10 Sv respectively.

320 3.4 Ocean reanalysis

Valdivieso et al. (2014) computed freshwater transports from the Uni-321 versity of Reading UR025.4 ocean reanalysis (1993-2010) at $1/4^{\circ}$ resolu-322 tion. This reanalysis uses a variational method with the NEMO ocean 323 modelling framework to constrain the ocean state by numerous obser-324 vations (AVISO, Argo, etc.). The simulation is forced by ERA-Interim 325 atmospheric reanalysis at the ocean surface and the Dai and Trenberth 326 (2002) runoff at the land mask edge. Note that the *e* field used to force 327 the model is not taken from the ERA-Interim reanalysis, but recomputed 328 as a function of the modeled SST. In addition, E - P - R estimates 329 from Valdivieso et al. (2014) include increments from the data assimila-330 tion method, *i.e.* it is assumed that assimilation increments to the ocean 331 state, required by oceanic observations, represent errors in the surface 332 forcing. 333

The "Estimating the Circulation and Climate of the Ocean" project version 4 (ECCOv4; Forget *et al.*, 2015) uses an adjoint-based method at $\sim 1^{\circ}$ resolution with the MITgcm to fit the time-evolving (1992-2011) ocean state to numerous observations (WOCE sections, Argo, sea level anomalies, sea ice concentration, satellite SST products, etc). Freshwater transport divergences shown here are computed using eq. (3). Note that,
as for the UR025.4 ocean reanalysis, atmospheric variables from ERAInterim are used to compute air-sea fluxes (from bulk formulae and the
simulated ocean state) and that they are adjusted as part of the optimization procedure to fit the modeled trajectory to ocean observations.

³⁴⁴ 4 Comparison of E - P - R estimates

In this section we compare the seven datasets described in section 3 and 345 shown in Figs. 2 and 3. To recap, the estimates from ERA-Interim and 346 Dai and Trenberth (2003) (ERA-40) combine atmospheric reanalyses with 347 the Dai and Trenberth (2002) runoff estimate. Schanze *et al.* (2010) also 348 uses atmospheric data, with E and P coming from separate datasets. 349 Valdivieso et al. (2014) and ECCOV4 are both based on ocean reanaly-350 ses while Ganachaud and Wunsch (2003) and Talley (2008) use oceano-351 graphic observations alone. 352

Fig. 2 shows E-P-R for the Atlantic, Pacific and Indian basins for each dataset described in section 3; panel (a) corresponds approximately to the latitudinal band 35°S-45°N and panel (b) to 35°S-65°N. The exact latitudinal boundaries used in calculating each estimate are shown in Table 1. Error bars are shown for most of the estimates although Dai and

Trenberth (2003) and Schanze et al. (2010) did not provide any estimates 358 of uncertainty. The error bars on the ERA-Interim based estimated are 359 a combination of interannual variability and the div $\mathbf{Q} - (E - P)$ resid-360 ual using the error in quadrature method. The uncertainties presented 361 by Ganachaud and Wunsch (2003) include uncertainties in the Ekman 362 transport (set to 50% of the initial value) and model error which is domi-363 nated by aliasing of ocean variability (see section 3.3). Talley (2008) used 364 a Monte Carlo approach to estimate the errors in the Ekman and geostrophic 365 components of freshwater transports. For a full discussion of the error 366 calculations performed, refer to section 2.3 of Talley (2008). The uncer-367 tainties presented for the ECCOv4 estimate represent interannual vari-368 ability of the freshwater divergences. Valdivieso et al. (2014) presented 369 uncertainties which represent interannual variability in the eddy and through-370 flow components of freshwater transport. 371

All estimates show that the Atlantic has a higher E - P - R than the Pacific at both latitude ranges. Most of the estimates suggest that Indian E - P - R is almost as high as the Atlantic in (a), with two suggesting that the Indian E - P - R is greater. Most studies suggest that the Pacific has a low E - P - R for the latitude range in (a) except for Schanze *et al.* (2010) who find a high E - P - R value for the Pacific that is close to the Atlantic values. ERA-Interim matches ERA-40 (Dai and

Trenberth, 2003) in the Atlantic and Pacific and has higher E - P - R379 in the Indian Ocean. The error bars are small, indicating that the bud-380 get residual and interannual variability of ERA-Interim E - P is low 381 and that the asymmetry between Atlantic and Pacific is steady in time. 382 The larger error bars for the Pacific suggest that interannual variability 383 of E - P is higher or that the budget residual is higher (or a combina-384 tion of both). The oceanographic estimates of Ganachaud and Wunsch 385 (2003) and Talley (2008) match within their uncertainty estimates in all 386 basins. The ECCOv4 estimate agrees remarkably well with the ERA-387 Interim estimate in all basins. Valdivieso *et al.* (2014), however, is con-388 sistently higher than all other estimates apart from Schanze et al. (2010) 389 in the Pacific. 390

When extending the domain further north (Fig. 2b), the asymmetry 391 between the Atlantic and Pacific oceans becomes stronger as three of the 392 estimates indicate that the Pacific has negative E - P - R while the At-393 lantic E - P - R remains positive in all estimates. Talley (2008) actually 394 finds that Atlantic E - P - R increases with the northward extension 395 of the domain (see below). Note that Valdivieso et al. (2014) gives lower 396 E - P - R than both atmospheric reanalyses and ECCOv4 possibly due 397 to the more northerly extent used (see Table 1). Overall, the estimates 398 are consistent in highlighting the differences in E - P - R between ocean 399

400 basins.

In order to see whether the differences between basins is found (and 401 robust) at smaller scale, E - P - R in latitude bands are shown in Fig. 402 3. The size of these bands is limited by the resolution of the Ganachaud 403 and Wunsch (2003) and Talley (2008) estimates which are based on the 404 routes taken by ships collecting the hydrographic sections. In the midlat-405 itude North Atlantic, Talley (2008) produces a band with positive E -406 P - R whereas the other estimates give negative values. This explains 407 why the basin-integrated E - P - R from Talley (2008) increases when 408 the domain is extended to 60°N in Fig. 2(b). Inspection of e - p (Fig. 1) 409 shows net precipitation poleward of 45°N in all basins. This value for the 410 North Atlantic from Talley (2008) is clearly an outlier although there is 411 a large uncertainty for that band. ERA-Interim and Dai and Trenberth 412 (2003) are well matched in the midlatitude North Atlantic but ERA-Interim 413 E - P - R is greater in the northern and southern subtropics with the 414 opposite occurring in the tropics. ECCOv4 agrees well with ERA-Interim 415 throughout the Atlantic but has notably lower E - P - R in the southern 416 hemisphere subtropics. The error bars on the ERA-Interim $\operatorname{div}\mathbf{Q}$, how-417 ever, are somewhat larger in these bands than in the northernmost band 418 due to residuals which are an order of magnitude larger. It is also impor-419 tant to note that these estimates are all taken over different time periods 420

⁴²¹ so important events may have been missed out.

In the northern hemisphere subtropical Pacific (Fig. 3b) both atmo-422 spheric reanalyses (and NCEP, not shown) show weak positive E - P - R423 while four of the other estimates are negative (ECCOv4 is indistinguish-424 able from zero). The strongly positive Pacific E - P - R (in comparison to 425 other estimates) from Schanze *et al.* (2010) shown in Fig. 2 is mainly due 426 to a tropical band which has E - P - R = 0. The other estimates suggest 427 that the tropical band has negative E - P - R with the atmospheric re-428 analyses producing stronger negative E - P - R than Ganachaud and 429 Wunsch (2003) and Valdivieso *et al.* (2014). From $47^{\circ}N$ to the Bering 430 Strait each estimate agrees that the Pacific has negative E - P - R al-431 though it is worth noting that the estimates based on atmospheric data 432 give values of E - P - R which are more negative than the oceanographic 433 estimates. 434

In the Indian Ocean (Fig. 3c) the atmospheric reanalyses do not agree as closely as they do over the other ocean basins. This difference appears to occur over the southern part of the ocean and may be a direct result of the different bands used (Table 1) which may also contribute towards ERA-Interim having the highest E - P - R overall in that band. The two atmospheric reanalysis products agree much closer in the other two bands but there is more disagreement between the estimates in these

bands (despite falling within error bars). One reason for this may be that 442 the oceanographic estimates based on hydrographic sections do not rep-443 resent climatology and are therefore significantly biased by various fac-444 tors affecting the freshwater transport such as ITCZ location and wind 445 speed. The different values of the ITF transport used by Ganachaud and 446 Wunsch (2003) and Talley (2008) may also be a factor in the large dif-447 ferences between these estimates. All estimates are in good agreement in 448 the subtropics with a range of approximately E - P - R = 0.15 Sv. 449 A key outcome of the above analysis is that the net freshwater flux 450 $E\,-\,P\,-\,R$ from ERA-Interim div ${\bf Q}$ combined with Dai and Trenberth 451 (2002) runoff agrees well with other estimates, both at basin scale and 452 in latitude bands. We use this as a basis for further analyzing the ERA-453

ERA-Interim E and P

Interim fields.

454

 $\mathbf{5}$ 455

As shown in section 4, the globally averaged residual between $\operatorname{div}\mathbf{Q}$ and 456 E - P from time-average surface accumulated forecasts is small in ERA-457 Interim. The 1979-2014 annual mean globally-averaged residual is $0.06 \pm$ 458 0.3 mm/day which is an order of magnitude higher than the residual of 459 $0.003 \pm 0.3 \text{ mm/day}$ calculated by Berrisford *et al.* (2011) for a shorter 460

time period (1989-2008). Residuals at the scale of ocean basins (Table 2) are also small and on the same order of magnitude as the global average. Additionally, basin-averaged residuals for both oceans are only small percentages of basin-averaged E and P (less than 3%). In the Atlantic the residual does not affect the sign of E - P - R estimates (cf error bars in Fig. 2) but since the Pacific basin-averaged E - P is close to zero, the sign of the net E - P - R is therefore rendered uncertain (Fig. 2).

Estimates of the partition of E - P into separate evaporation and 468 precipitation estimates over the global oceans are known to be 8-9% too 469 large in ERA-interim (Berrisford *et al.*, 2011) and they are also overes-470 timated in other reanalyses (Trenberth et al., 2011). Brown and Kum-471 merow (2014) point out that this problem is particularly marked in trop-472 ical regions although this has improved from ERA-40 (Dee et al., 2011). 473 They suggest that observations of near-surface specific humidity from 474 ships and buoys have a dry bias which results in an overestimation of 475 evaporation and therefore precipitation. In the extratropics, however, 476 precipitation tends to be underestimated. For example, England and Wales 477 precipitation in ERA-Interim is only 72% of the observed rainfall (de Leeuw 478 et al., 2015), with similar results found for other countries at the end of 479 the North Atlantic storm track. 480

481

We will now use the separate E and P fields (instead of div \mathbf{Q}) to

⁴⁸² further analyze the Atlantic/Pacific asymmetry.

483 5.1 Annual mean latitude bands

Fig. 4 shows the net freshwater flux and its constituent parts split into 10° latitude bands from 30°S to 60°N. Here, the fluxes are area-weighted averaged in each band to allow for a more meaningful comparison between ocean basins (e.g. a band in the tropical Pacific has much larger area than a band in the tropical Atlantic). Area-averaged evaporation, precipitation and runoff are denoted by \bar{e} , \bar{p} and \bar{r} respectively.

From Fig. 4 it is clear that, within each basin, \bar{p} is more variable 490 than \bar{e} across latitudinal bands, with peaks in the deep tropics showing 491 the location of the ITCZ. Evaporation decreases with latitude in the north-492 ern hemisphere, reflecting the influence of SST on evaporation (D'Addezio 493 and Bingham, 2014) as well as the lower relative humidity characteristic 494 of the subtropical atmosphere (due to air coming from neighbouring con-495 tinents and descending into the boundary layer in the subtropical highs). 496 In the Atlantic (Fig. 4a), runoff has a particularly large impact on the 497 net surface flux: despite \bar{e} exceeding \bar{p} in the 0°S-10°S band, the net flux 498 is negative because of large runoff (\bar{r}) from rivers such as the Amazon 499 and Congo. 500

501

To further localize the asymmetries seen at large scale (Figs. 2 and

⁵⁰² 3), the differences (Pacific minus Atlantic) are shown in Fig. 5. The most ⁵⁰³ noticeable asymmetry is that Pacific \bar{p} exceeds Atlantic \bar{p} in almost all ⁵⁰⁴ latitudes with the difference peaking slightly above 100 cm/yr in the 20-⁵⁰⁵ 10°S band, likely due to the presence of the SPCZ. Note that south of ⁵⁰⁶ 30°N \bar{e} is remarkably similar in both ocean basins.

In the 50°N-60°N band, Atlantic \bar{p} is 15 cm/yr greater than in the 507 Pacific. Note that this result is sensitive to the choice of the latitudinal 508 extents: for slightly larger bands (Emile-Geay et al., 2003; Wills and Schnei-509 der, 2015), \bar{p} is similar across basins and \bar{e} is greater in the Atlantic than 510 the Pacific. Polewards of 40°N the Atlantic \bar{e} exceeds the Pacific \bar{e} by 511 about 20 cm/yr: this is likely related to higher SSTs in the North At-512 lantic than the North Pacific (Warren, 1983) and the greater fraction of 513 the North Atlantic affected by the advection of cold, dry air from the 514 continents (Schmitt et al., 1989). Wills and Schneider (2015) argued that 515 the asymmetry in the subpolar regions is primarily due to moisture fluxes 516 from transient eddies which cause negative E-P over the subpolar North 517 Pacific and positive E - P over the subpolar North Atlantic. The total 518 runoff into the Atlantic is greater than into the Pacific with most of the 519 difference between the two basins occurring in the 0° -10°N and 10°S-0° 520 bands where some of the world's largest rivers can be found. The mouths 521 of the two largest (Amazon and Congo) plus three of the top twenty are 522

⁵²³ in the band to the south of the equator (Dai and Trenberth, 2002). The ⁵²⁴ Orinoco (third largest) and three more of the top forty discharge into the ⁵²⁵ Atlantic band immediately north of the equator.

Although a larger \bar{e} is found in the North Atlantic than in the North 526 Pacific, the asymmetry in the net freshwater flux across the basins is mostly 527 caused by an asymmetry in \bar{p} , *i.e.* relatively stronger precipitation in the 528 Pacific. There are only three 10° bands where Pacific $\bar{e} - \bar{p} - \bar{r}$ is greater. 529 Two of which $(10^{\circ}\text{S}-0^{\circ} \text{ and } 0^{\circ}-10^{\circ}\text{N})$ are a result of the strong asymmetry 530 in \bar{r} (masking a large precipitation excess in the Pacific) and the other is 531 the narrow northern most band in the Pacific which contributes very lit-532 tle to the basin-averaged net flux. Note that despite the fact that these 533 bands have less negative $\bar{e} - \bar{p} - \bar{r}$ in the Pacific, the salinity asymmetry 534 still holds at all latitudes. 535

536 5.2 Seasonal variation

Fig. 6 shows the seasonal cycle of \bar{e} and \bar{p} for each ocean basin; the maps of the climatological seasonal means of e - p, e and p are shown in Figs. 7-9. Atlantic and Pacific mean evaporation rates are very similar (and quite constant at ~4 mm/day). There is however a substantially lower precipitation rate in the Atlantic than in the Pacific, with Atlantic \bar{p} near 2.5 mm/day compared to 4 mm/day in the Pacific. These features are ⁵⁴³ present throughout the year, with the $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ always positive over the At-⁵⁴⁴ lantic and always close to zero over the Pacific. In the Pacific, \bar{e} and \bar{p} ⁵⁴⁵ have similar annual cycles with a decrease from January to May followed ⁵⁴⁶ by an increase during the rest of the year. The annual cycle of \bar{e} has a ⁵⁴⁷ similar amplitude (~ 0.7 mm/day) in both basins but the amplitude of \bar{p} ⁵⁴⁸ is weaker in the Pacific (~ 0.5 mm/day compared to ~ 0.8 mm/day).

These effects are also reflected in the spatial pattern of seasonal e-p549 which largely follows the spatial pattern of precipitation (Figs. 7-9). The 550 subtropical regions (where e - p > 0) are characterized by a lack of pre-551 cipitation in all seasons with the shape and size of the region of positive 552 e - p approximately matching the shape and size of the regions with p < p553 2 mm/day. Seasonal variations of evaporation (Fig. 8) are most notice-554 able in the subtropical maxima and in the peaks over western boundary 555 currents. Both oceans show maxima of evaporation in the northern hemi-556 sphere winter which is a result of increased wind speeds and the lower 557 relative humidity. The advection of dry (subsaturated) winter air from 558 continents to the oceans maintains high rate of evaporation, and there-559 fore high wintertime latent heat flux, over the western part of basins, and 560 notably over Western Boundary Currents such as the Gulf Stream and 561 Kuroshio (Yu and Weller, 2007). 562

563

Further decomposing the seasonal cycle into latitudinal bands shows

that the October/November peak in Atlantic \bar{p} occurs in the northern 564 hemisphere (Fig. 10b). During autumn the water vapour content of the 565 subtropics is higher due to increased evaporation (Fig. 8d) and this is 566 picked up by the storm tracks leading to increased meridional water vapour 567 transport. D'Addezio and Bingham (2014) also attribute the autumn 568 peak in subtropical North Atlantic precipitation to African easterly wave 569 activity and tropical storm activity. Wang et al. (2013) highlights the 570 influence of seasonal cycle of SSTs and the Atlantic Warm Pool (AWP) 571 area, both of which peak in September along with \bar{p} in the 15°N-35°N 572 band (the AWP is a region of $SST > 28.5^{\circ}C$ in the western tropical North 573 Atlantic, 5°N-30°N). A minimum of SSS also occurs in the AWP region 574 in September with a maximum in March when the AWP disappears (a 575 month after the E - P maximum). Initially the peak is in the subtrop-576 ics but is later maintained at higher latitudes in winter (Figs. 9a,d). The 577 double peak in tropical Atlantic precipitation is a due to the seasonal 578 migration of the ITCZ which dominates the tropical SSS seasonal cycle 579 (Boyer and Levitus, 2002). 580

The annual cycle of Pacific \bar{p} (Fig. 11(b)) is also dominated by the northern hemisphere (reflecting the fact that most of the domain used to define the Pacific in this study is in the northern hemisphere), with the May-July minimum occuring in the midlatitudes due to a relatively weak storm track. The peaks in \bar{p} in the northern subtropics in August and during winter in the midlatitudes are due to the same process found in the subtropical North Atlantic at the same times of year.

588 5.3 Interannual variability

The interannual variability of evaporation, precipitation, $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ and divQ 589 are shown along with the GPCP estimate of precipitation (Adler *et al.*, 590 2003) as anomalies from their respective annual means in Fig. 12. Pre-591 cipitation time series are shown as $-\bar{p}$ in order to simplify the compar-592 ison with $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ and divQ. Until 2002, ERA-Interim precipitation ap-593 pears to match GPCP variability well (particularly over the Atlantic) 594 but the two datasets differ significantly in 2002-06. This is particularly 595 evident over the Pacific where ERA-Interim $-\bar{p}$ increases sharply while 596 -GPCP does not. This shift in precipitation is due to a problem with 597 the assimilation of rain-affected radiances that caused an incorrect dry-598 ing of the atmosphere (Dee *et al.*, 2011). Note the large offset between 599 div**Q** and $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ in the Pacific (Fig. 12b). ERA-Interim does, however, 600 capture some of the El Niño-driven variability *i.e.* the 1997-98 El Niño 601 is shown by a dip in $-\bar{p}$ by both ERA-Interim and GPCP. The Atlantic 602 appears to be less affected by the assimilation problems: the GPCP vari-603 ability from 2004-06 is reproduced in $-\bar{p}$ while still offset from -GPCP604

by ~ 3 cm/yr. ERA-Interim also successfully reproduces the large $-\bar{p}$ 605 decrease (a subsequent decrease in $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$) in 2010 associated with a record 606 low North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) Index and a 30% reduction in the 607 AMOC (Roberts et al., 2013; Bryden et al., 2014). Increases in the area 608 of the AWP on interannual timescales are shown to reduce E - P due 609 to increased SSTs and therefore increased moisture convergence into the 610 region resulting in increased precipitation (Wang *et al.*, 2013). This then 611 causes negative SSS anomalies which Wang et al. (2013) speculated may 612 have an impact on the strength of the AMOC. 613

Evaporation appears to be less variable than precipitation in both 614 basins and contributes less to the variability of ERA-Interim $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$. In 615 the Pacific, however, evaporation changes contribute significantly to \bar{e} – 616 \bar{p} changes during the events such as the 1997-98 El Niño. This El Niño 617 event is known to have caused an SSS decrease in the western equatorial 618 Pacific and an SSS increase around the SPCZ, with precipitation consid-619 ered to be one of the main mechanisms responsible for these SSS changes 620 (Singh et al., 2011). Increasing trends in \bar{e} are evident in both basins through-621 out the ERA-Interim period. The Pacific trend is stronger than the At-622 lantic trend, with \bar{e} increasing at a rate of 3.4 mm/yr/yr (least-squares 623 linear fit) compared to 2.0 mm/yr/yr in the Atlantic. Increasing trends 624 in oceanic evaporation are also present in other datasets (Iwasaki et al., 625

2014; Su and Feng, 2015). Yu and Weller (2007) show that latent heat 626 flux has increased in line with SSTs, resulting in an increase in evapo-627 ration rate of approximately 10 cm/yr from 1986-2005. This value com-628 pares well with ERA-Interim (Fig. 12) for the same period over the Pa-629 cific. As well as increasing SSTs, increasing wind speed has also been 630 noted to contribute to increasing evaporation rates (Yu, 2007; Iwasaki 631 et al., 2014). Column-integrated water vapour has also been increasing as 632 shown by the Special Sensor Microwave Imager (SSM/I), a trend which 633 is well represented by reanalyses (Zhang et al., 2013). Such an increase 634 in column-integrated water vapour would require a corresponding increase 635 in oceanic evaporation. This suggests that, unlike the precipitation trends, 636 evaporation trends in ERA-Interim may be real and capture a physical 637 change (although Brown and Kummerow (2014) show that ERA-Interim 638 overestimates tropical evaporation). 639

Table 3 shows the correlations of \bar{e} , $-\bar{p}$, $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ with div**Q** and the standard deviations of each field. The correlations highlight the inconsistencies between the two methods of calculating the surface water flux. The moisture flux divergence is better correlated with $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ over the Atlantic than the Pacific. In particular, $-\bar{p}$ and div**Q** are poorly correlated over the Pacific, as expected from Fig. 12b. The standard deviations show that all Pacific fluxes are more variable than the Atlantic fluxes, with $-\bar{p}$ ⁶⁴⁷ showing more interannual variablity than \bar{e} over each ocean. Table 3 also ⁶⁴⁸ shows that the asymmetry in \bar{p} discussed in section 5.2 is also steady on ⁶⁴⁹ interannual time scales, with Pacific \bar{p} exceeding Atlantic \bar{p} by approxi-⁶⁵⁰ mately 40 cm/yr (not shown).

Although Fig. 12 also shows that $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ mainly follows the interan-651 nual variability of $-\bar{p}$, the variability and trends in ERA-Interim are, as 652 discussed above, not robust. That said, in the Atlantic before 2002 when 653 ERA-Interim \bar{p} matches GPCP well (correlation coefficient of 0.82), $-\bar{p}$ 654 correlates with div**Q** better than with \bar{e} (0.59 with $-\bar{p}$ over both oceans 655 and 0.11 and 0.32 for \bar{e} in the Atlantic and Pacific respectively). This 656 suggests that \bar{p} may well dominate $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ variability in the Atlantic (at 657 least before 2002). In the Pacific, correlation between ERA-Interim and 658 GPCP before 2002 are poorer (only 0.43), and the dominant factor in 659 variability cannot be deduced. 660

661 6 Summary and Conclusions

In this paper, we compare seven estimates of the net freshwater flux (E - P - R) over oceans, with a focus on the E - P - R asymmetry between the Atlantic and Pacific oceans. Using ERA-Interim, which compares favourably with other estimates, we proceed on exploring the At⁶⁶⁶ lantic/Pacific asymmetry on spatial (10° latitudinal bands) and temporal ⁶⁶⁷ (seasonal, interannual) scales not accessible with some other datasets as ⁶⁶⁸ well as investigating the role of precipitation, evaporation and runoff sep-⁶⁶⁹ arately on the E - P - R asymmetry. Our key findings are:

1. Net surface water fluxes estimated from atmospheric reanalyses are 670 consistent with the ocean temperature and salinity observations used 671 to estimate net freshwater fluxes from hydrographic section data. 672 Both are also consistent with other datasets including recent ocean 673 reanalyses. All estimates show that the Atlantic has greater positive 674 E - P - R than the Pacific. Pacific E - P - R is approximately 0 675 Sv when the subpolar region is included and is approximately 0.4 Sv 676 less than Atlantic E - P - R. Agreement between datasets is less 677 strong in smaller latitude bands, however the E - P - R still holds 678 in the tropics and northern hemisphere although not in the southern 679 hemisphere subtropics (due to the larger area of the Pacific). 680

⁶⁸¹ 2. We also find that ERA-Interim div**Q** and E-P from surface forecast ⁶⁸² accumulations agree well when averaged globally or across ocean basins ⁶⁸³ (consistent with Berrisford *et al.*, 2011) which establishes the va-⁶⁸⁴ lidity of the ERA-Interim estimates for further diagnostics. Annual ⁶⁸⁵ mean area-averaged evaporation, precipitation, runoff and E - P - R

across 10° latitude bands show that the asymmetry in E - P - R686 in the high latitude northern hemisphere is mainly due to greater 687 evaporation from the Atlantic (e.g. Warren, 1983; Emile-Geay et al., 688 2003) but everywhere further south it appears that a stronger asym-689 metry in precipitation is more important in contributing to the asym-690 metry in E - P - R. At basin scale the E - P - R asymmetry is 691 largely caused by a precipitation asymmetry, rather than an evap-692 oration asymmetry. One potential mechanism for this is linked to 693 the patterns of stationary eddies over the two basins: the subtrop-694 ical highs (areas of dry, descending air and low precipitation) cover 695 a larger fraction of the Atlantic than the Pacific where ascendind-696 ing air (which leads to precipitation) covers a larger fraction of the 697 basin. (Wills and Schneider, 2015). 698

3. The seasonal cycles of basin-averaged evaporation and precipitation
show that the Atlantic/Pacific asymmetry exists throughout the year
and is quite steady *i.e.* no particular season contributes to the asymmetry. Throughout the year, Pacific evaporation and precipitation
are approximately equal but Atlantic precipitation is always less than
evaporation. There is little difference between basin-averaged evaporation but basin-averaged precipitation is less in the Atlantic than

the Pacific for all months.

4. Because of problems with the assimilation of satellite data described 707 by Dee *et al.* (2011), trends and interannual variability in precipita-708 tion are not robust (a conclusion supported by a comparison with 709 GPCP precipitation). It is therefore problematic to explore the in-710 terannual variability of precipitation and its correlation with E - P. 711 An upward trend in evaporation over recent decades in both basins 712 appears to be consistent with the estimate from OAFlux. The inter-713 annual variability of the basin-averaged E - P fluxes exhibit correla-714 tions with events such as large El Niño and NAO events. 715

Overall, a key finding of this study is that the E - P - R asymmetry 716 between the Atlantic and Pacific oceans exists at all latitudes, not just 717 high-latitudes and that, outside of the high latitude northern hemisphere, 718 an asymmetry in precipitation, rather than evaporation, has more influ-719 ence on the asymmetry in E - P - R. Precipitation is largely driven by in-720 ternal atmospheric processes (circulation patterns, atmospheric physics). 721 This suggests that E - P - R and possibly SSS and MOC asymmetries are 722 caused by differences in atmospheric processes over the two basins. Some 723 potential mechanisms have been suggested in the literature: the basin ge-724 ometry (Schmitt et al., 1989; Ferreira et al., 2010; Nilsson et al., 2013), 725

⁷²⁶ the effect of mountain ranges (Schmittner *et al.*, 2011; Sinha *et al.*, 2012), ⁷²⁷ variability and tilt of the Atlantic storm track (Czaja, 2009) and the pat-⁷²⁸ terns of stationary eddies (Wills and Schneider, 2015).

Considering on one hand the link between the high salinity of the 729 Atlantic, the deep convection and the AMOC, and on the other the link 730 between SSS distribution and e - p - r pattern, we argue that any theory 731 for the localization of the MOC in the Atlantic should provide an expla-732 nation for the E - P - R asymmetry, and thus for the deficit of precip-733 itation over the Atlantic. It is worth emphasizing that an E - P - R734 asymmetry may not be neccessary to localize deep water formation in 735 the Atlantic and favour an AMOC. This is notably the case in the pres-736 ence of multiple equilibria of the MOC where localization is possible with 737 no asymmetry or reversed asymmetry (smaller E - P - R in the sink-738 ing basin, see Huisman et al. 2009). However, even if the real ocean is in 739 this dynamical regime, the observed E - P - R asymmetry provides a 740 significant reinforcement of the AMOC (an atmospheric feedback or per-741 haps just a coincidence *e.q.* due to geometrical factors), and should be 742 accounted for. 743

744 Acknowledgements

The lead author receives PhD studentship funding from the Natural Environment Research Council as part of the SCENARIO Doctoral Training Partnership (NE/L002566/1).

748 **References**

- Adler, R., Huffman, G., Chang, A., Ferraro, R., Xie, P., and co-authors.
 2003. The version-2 global precipitation climatology project (GPCP)
 monthly precipitation project analysis (1979-present). J. Hydrometeor.,
 4, 1147–1167.
- ⁷⁵³ Baumgartner, A. and Reichel, E. 1975. *The World Water Balance*. Else⁷⁵⁴ vier.
- ⁷⁵⁵ Berrisford, P., Kållberg, P., Kobayashi, S., Dee, D., Uppala, S., and
- co-authors. 2011. Atmospheric conservation properties in ERA-Interim. *Quart. J. Roy. Meteor. Soc.*, 137, 1381–1399.
- ⁷⁵⁸ Boyer, T. and Levitus, S. 2002. Harmonic analysis of climatological sea
 ⁷⁵⁹ surface salinity. J. Geophys. Res. Oceans, **107**. 8006.
- ⁷⁶⁰ Brown, P. and Kummerow, C. 2014. An Assessment of Atmospheric Wa-

- ter Budget Components over Tropical Oceans. J. Climate, 27, 2054–
 2071.
- Bryden, H., King, B., McCarthy, G., and McDonagh, E. 2014. Impact of
 a 30% reduction in Atlantic meridional overturning circulation during
 2009-2010. Ocean Sci., 10, 683–691.
- ⁷⁶⁶ Czaja, A. 2009. Atmospheric Control on the Thermohaline Circulation.
 ⁷⁶⁷ J. Climate, **39**, 234–247.
- D'Addezio, J. and Bingham, F. 2014. A subtropical North Atlantic regional atmospheric moisture budget. J. Geophys. Res. Oceans, 119(12),
 8731–8748.
- Dai, A. and Trenberth, K. 2002. Estimates of Freshwater Discharge from
 Continents: Latitudinal and Seasonal Variations. J. Hydrometeor., 3,
 660–687.
- Dai, A. and Trenberth, K. 2003. New Estimates of Continental Discharge
 and Oceanic Freshwater Transport. In AMS Symposium on Observing
 and Understanding the Variability of Water in Weather and Climate,
 Long Beach, CA.
- de Leeuw, J., Methven, J., and Blackburn, M. 2015. Evaluation of ERA-

- Interim reanalysis precipitation products using England and Wales observations. *Quart. J. Roy. Meteor. Soc.*, 141, 798–806.
- ⁷⁸¹ Dee, D., Uppala, S., Simmons, A., Berrisford, P., Poli, P., and
- co-authors. 2011. The ERA-Interim Reanalysis: configuration and per-
- formance of the data assimilation system. Quart. J. Roy. Meteor. Soc.,
 137, 553–597.
- Durack, P. and Wijffels, S. 2010. Fifty-Year Trends in Global Ocean
 Salinities and Their Relationship to Broad-Scale Warming. J. Climate,
 23, 4342–4362.
- Emile-Geay, J., Cane, M., Naik, N., Seager, R., Clement, A., and van
 Geen, A. 2003. Warren revisited: Atmospheric freshwater fluxes and
 "Why is no deep water formed in the North Pacific". J. Geophys. Res.Oceans, 108. 3178.
- Ferreira, D., Marshall, J., and Campin, J.-M. 2010. Localization of Deep
 Water Formation: Role of Atmospheric Moisture Transport and Geometrical Constraints on Ocean Circulation. J. Climate, 23, 1456–1476.
- ⁷⁹⁵ Forget, G., Campin, J.-M., Heimbach, P., Hill, C., Ponte, R., and Wun-
- ⁷⁹⁶ sch, C. 2015. ECCO version 4: an integrated framework for non-linear

- inverse modeling and global ocean state estimation. Geosci. Model 797 Dev., 8(10), 3071-3104.798
- Ganachaud, A. and Wunsch, C. 2003. Large-Scale Ocean Heat and 799
- Freshwater Transports during the World Ocean Circulation Experi-800 ment. J. Climate, 16, 696–705. 801
- Ganachaud, A., Wunsch, C., Marotzke, J., and Toole, J. 2000. Merid-802 ional overturning and large-scale circulation of the Indian Ocean. J. 803 *Geophys. Res. Oceans*, **105**(C11), 26117–26134.
- Gordon, A., Giulivi, C., Busecke, J., and Bingham, F. 2015. Differences 805
- Among Subtropical Surface Salinity Patterns. Oceanography, 28, 32–39. 806
- Held, I. and Soden, B. 2006. Robust Responses of the Hydrological Cycle 807 to Global Warming. J. Climate, **19**, 5686–1560. 808
- Huisman, S., Dijkstra, H., von der Heydt, A., and de Ruijter, W. 2009. 809
- Robustness of multiple equilibria in the global ocean circulation. Geo-810 *phys. Res. Lett.*, **36**(1). L01610. 811
- Iwasaki, S., Kubota, M., and Watabe, T. 2014. Assessment of various 812
- global freshwater flux products for the global ice-free oceans. *Remote* 813
- Sens. Environ., **140**, 549–561. 814

804

⁸¹⁵ Marshall, J. and Schott, F. 1999. Open-ocean convection: Observations, theory and models. *Rev. Geophys.*, **37**, 1–64.

Nilsson, J., Langen, P., Ferreira, D., and Marshall, J. 2013. Ocean Basin
Geometry and the Salinification of the Atlantic Ocean. J. Climate, 26,
6163–6184.

Rahmstorf, S. 1996. On the freshwater forcing and transport of the Atlantic thermohaline circulation. *Climate Dyn.*, **12**, 799–811.

Ren, L., Hackert, E., Arkin, P., and Busalacchi, A. 2014. Estimating
the global oceanic net freshwater flux from Argo and comparing it with
satellite-bases freshwater flux products. J. Geophys. Res. Oceans, 119,
7869–7881.

Roberts, C., Waters, J., Peterson, K., Palmer, M., McCarthy, G., and
co-authors. 2013. Atmosphere drives recent interannual variability of
the Atlantic meridional overturning circulation at 26.5°N. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 40(19), 5164–5170.

Schanze, J., Schmitt, R., and Yu, L. 2010. The global oceanic freshwater
cycle: A state-of-the-art quantification. J. Mar. Res., 68, 569–595.

Schmitt, R. 2008. Salinity and the Global Water Cycle. Oceanography,
21, 12–19.

- Schmitt, R., Bogden, P., and Dorman, C. 1989. Evaporation Minus
 Precipitation and Density Fluxes for the North Atlantic. J. Phys.
 Oceanogr., 19, 1208–1221.
- Schmittner, A., Silva, T., Fraedrich, K., Kirk, E., and Lunkeit, E. 2011.
- Effects of Mountains and Ice Sheets on Global Ocean Circulation. J. Climate, 24, 2814–2829.
- Seager, R. and Henderson, N. 2013. Diagnostic Computation of Moisture
- ⁸⁴¹ Budgets in the ERA-Interim Reanalysis with Reference to Analysis of
- ⁸⁴² CMIP-Archived Atmospheric Model Data. J. Climate, 26, 7876–7901.
- ⁸⁴³ Singh, A., Delcroix, T., and Cravatte, S. 2011. Contrasting the flavors of
- El Niño-Southern Oscillation using sea surface salinity observations. J. *Geophys. Res. Oceans*, **116**(C6).
- Sinha, B., Blaker, A., Hirschi, J.-M., Bonham, S., Brand, M., and
- co-authors. 2012. Mountain ranges favour vigorous Atlantic meridional
 overturning. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, **39**. L02705.
- Skliris, N., Marsh, R., Josey, S., Good, S., Liu, C., and Allan, R. 2014.
- Salinity changes in the World Ocean since 1950 in relation to changing
 surface freshwater fluxes. *Climate Dyn.*, 43, 709–736.
- ⁸⁵² Su, T. and Feng, G. 2015. Spatial-temporal variation characteristics of

- global evaporation revealed by eight reanalyses. *Sci. China Ser. D*, **58**, 255–269.
- Talley, L. 2008. Freshwater transport estimates and the global overturning circulation: Shallow, deep and throughflow components. *Prog. Oceanogr.*, 78, 257–303.
- Tchilibou, M., Delcroix, T., Alory, G., Arnault, S., and Reverdin, G.
 2015. Variations of the tropical Atlantic and Pacific SSS minimum
 zones and their relations to the ITCZ and SPCZ rain bands (19792009). J. Geophys. Res. Oceans, 120, 5090–5100.
- Trenberth, K. and Caron, J. 2001. Estimates of Meridional Atmosphere
 and Ocean Heat Transports. J. Climate, 14, 3433–3443.
- Trenberth, K., Fasullo, J., and Mackaro, J. 2011. Atmospheric Moisture
 Transports from Ocean to Land and Global Energy Flows in Reanalyses. J. Climate, 24, 4907–4924.
- Valdivieso, M., Haines, K., Zuo, H., and Lea, D. 2014. Freshwater and
 heat transports from global ocean synthesis. J. Geophys. Res., 119,
 394–409.
- Wang, C., Zhang, L., and Lee, S.-K. 2013. Response of Freshwater Flux

- and Sea Surface Salinity to Variability of the Atlantic Warm Pool. J. *Climate*, 26, 1249–1267.
- ⁸⁷³ Warren, B. 1983. Why is no deep water formed in the North Pacific? J. ⁸⁷⁴ Mar. Res., 41, 327–347.
- ⁸⁷⁵ Weaver, A., Bitz, C., Fanning, A., and Holland, M. 1999. Thermohaline
 ⁸⁷⁶ Circulation: High-Latitude Phenomena and the Difference Between the
 ⁸⁷⁷ Pacific and Atlantic. Annu. Rev. Earth Pl. Sc., 27, 231–285.
- Weijer, W., de Ruijter, W., Dijkstra, H., and van Leeuwen, P. 1999. Im-
- pact of Interbasin Exchange on the Atlantic Overturning Circulation.
- ⁸⁸⁰ J. Phys. Oceanogr., **29**, 2266–2284.
- ⁸⁸¹ Wijffels, S. 2001. Ocean Transport of Fresh Water. In G. Siedler,
- J. Church, and J. Gould, editors, *Ocean Circulation and Climate*, pages 475–488. Academic Press, London.
- ⁸⁸⁴ Wijffels, S., Schmitt, R., Bryden, H., and Stigebrandt, A. 1992. Trans-⁸⁸⁵ port of Freshwater by the Oceans. J. Phys. Oceanogr., **22**, 155–162.
- Wills, R. and Schneider, T. 2015. Stationary eddies and the zonal asym-
- metry of net precipitation and ocean freshwater forcing. J. Climate, 28,
 5115–5133.

- Yu, L. 2007. Global Variations in Oceanic Evaporation (1958-2005): The 889 Role of the Changing Wind Speed. J. Climate, 20, 5376–5390. 890
- Yu, L. and Weller, R. 2007. Objectively Analyzed Air-Sea Heat Fluxes 891 for the Global Ice-Free Oceans (1981-2005). Bull. Amer. Meteor. Soc., 892 **88**, 527–539. 893
- Zhang, L., Wu, L., and Gan, B. 2013. Modes and Mechanisms of Global 894 Water Vapor Variability over the Twentieth Century. J. Climate, 26, 895 5578-5593. 896
- Zweng, M., Reagan, J., Antonov, J., Locarnini, R., Mishonov, A., and 897 co-authors. 2013. Salinity. In S. Levitus and A. Mishonov, editors, 898 World Ocean Atlas 2013, volume 2. NOAA Atlas NESDIS 74.

899

Table 1: Table of latitude boundaries for each of the estimates shown in Figs. 2 and 3. The Mediterranean and Baltic Seas are included in the ERA-Interim estimate at the relevant basin scales and in the latitude bands where they join the main Atlantic Ocean. BS refers to the Bering Strait and a star denotes that the latitudes shown are only approximate.

	ERA-Interim & ECCOv4		Dai and Trenberth (2003)			
	Atlantic	Pacific	Indian	Atlantic	Pacific	Indian
Fig. 2(b)	$35^{\circ}\text{S-}60^{\circ}\text{N}$	30°S-BS	$>35^{\circ}S$	$32^{\circ}\text{S-}60^{\circ}\text{N}$	30°S-BS	$> 32^{\circ}S$
Fig. 2(a)	$35^{\circ}\text{S-}45^{\circ}\text{N}$	$30^{\circ}\text{S-}47^{\circ}\text{N}$		$32^{\circ}\text{S-}45^{\circ}\text{N}$	$30^{\circ}\text{S-}47^{\circ}\text{N}$	
Fig. 3	45° N- 60° N	47°N-BS		45° N- 60° N	47°N-BS	
Fig. 3	24° N- 45° N	24° N- 47° N	$>8^{\circ}S$	$24^{\circ}\text{N}-45^{\circ}\text{N}$	$24^{\circ}\text{N}-47^{\circ}\text{N}$	$>8^{\circ}S$
Fig. 3	$16^{\circ}\text{S-}24^{\circ}\text{N}$	$17^{\circ}\text{S-}24^{\circ}\text{N}$	$20^{\circ}\text{S-8}^{\circ}\text{S}$	$16^{\circ}\text{S-}24^{\circ}\text{N}$	$16^{\circ}\text{S-}24^{\circ}\text{N}$	$20^{\circ}\text{S-8}^{\circ}\text{S}$
Fig. 3	$35^{\circ}\text{S-}16^{\circ}\text{S}$	$30^{\circ}\text{S-}17^{\circ}\text{S}$	$35^{\circ}\text{S}-20^{\circ}\text{S}$	$30^{\circ}\text{S-}16^{\circ}\text{S}$	$30^{\circ}\text{S-}16^{\circ}\text{S}$	$32^{\circ}\text{S}-20^{\circ}\text{S}$
	Schanze <i>et</i>	al. (2010)		Ganachaud and Wunsch (2003)		2003)
	Atlantic	Pacific	Indian	Atlantic	Pacific	Indian
Fig. 2(b)	$35^{\circ}\text{S-}70^{\circ}\text{N*}$	35°S-BS	$>35^{\circ}S$			$> 32^{\circ}S$
Fig. 2(a)	$35^{\circ}\text{S-}45^{\circ}\text{N}$	$35^{\circ}\text{S-}45^{\circ}\text{N}$		$30^{\circ}\text{S-}47^{\circ}\text{N}$	$30^{\circ}\text{S-}47^{\circ}\text{N}$	
Fig. 3	45° N- 60° N	45°N-60°N				
Fig. 3	25° N- 45° N	25° N- 45° N	$>5^{\circ}S$	$24^{\circ}\text{N}-47^{\circ}\text{N}$	$24^{\circ}\text{N}-47^{\circ}\text{N}$	$>8^{\circ}S$
Fig. 3	$15^{\circ}\text{S-}25^{\circ}\text{N}$	$15^{\circ}\text{S}-25^{\circ}\text{N}$	$25^{\circ}\text{S}-5^{\circ}\text{S}$	$19^{\circ}\text{S-}24^{\circ}\text{N}$	$17^{\circ}\text{S-}24^{\circ}\text{N}$	$20^{\circ}\text{S-8}^{\circ}\text{S}$
Fig. 3	$35^{\circ}\text{S}\text{-}15^{\circ}\text{S}$	$35^{\circ}\text{S}\text{-}15^{\circ}\text{S}$	$35^{\circ}\text{S}-25^{\circ}\text{S}$	$30^{\circ}\text{S-}19^{\circ}\text{S}$	$30^{\circ}\text{S-}17^{\circ}\text{S}$	$32^{\circ}\text{S}-20^{\circ}\text{S}$
	Talley (2008)Valdivieso et al. (2014)		al. (2014)	_		
	Atlantic	Pacific	Indian	Atlantic	Pacific	Indian
Fig. 2(b)	$32^{\circ}\text{S-}59^{\circ}\text{N}$	30° S-BS	$>32^{\circ}S$	$32^{\circ}\text{S-}70^{\circ}\text{N}$	32°S-BS	$>32^{\circ}S$
Fig. 2(a)	$32^{\circ}\text{S-}45^{\circ}\text{N}$	$30^{\circ}\text{S-}47^{\circ}\text{N}$		$32^{\circ}\text{S-}47^{\circ}\text{N}$	$32^{\circ}\text{S-}47^{\circ}\text{N}$	
Fig. 3	45° N- 59° N	47°N-BS		47°N-70°N	47°N-BS	
Fig. 3	24° N- 45° N	24°N-47°N	$>8^{\circ}S$	$26.5^{\circ}\text{N}-47^{\circ}\text{N}$	24°N-47°N	
Fig. 3	$16^{\circ}\text{S-}24^{\circ}\text{N}$		$20^{\circ}\text{S-8}^{\circ}\text{S}$	$16^{\circ}\text{S-}26.5^{\circ}\text{N}$	$17^{\circ}\text{S-}24^{\circ}\text{N}$	
Fig. 3	$32^{\circ}\text{S-}16^{\circ}\text{S}$		$32^{\circ}\text{S}-20^{\circ}\text{S}$	$32^{\circ}\text{S-}16^{\circ}\text{S}$	$32^{\circ}\text{S-}17^{\circ}\text{S}$	$32^{\circ}\text{S}-20^{\circ}\text{S}$

Table 2: Annual mean (1979-2014) area-averaged moisture budget residuals for the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans with \bar{e} , \bar{p} and $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ in mm/day.

	residual	\bar{e}	\bar{p}	$\bar{e}-\bar{p}$
Atlantic	0.08	4.01	2.69	1.32
Pacific	0.08	4.14	4.07	0.07

Table 3: Pearson correlations (\tilde{r}) between annual means of ERA-Interim \bar{e} , $-\bar{p}$ and $\bar{e} - \bar{p}$ with div**Q** and standard deviations $(\underline{\sigma}, \text{cm/yr})$ of $\bar{e}, -\bar{p}, \bar{e} - \bar{p}$ and div**Q**.

	Atlantic		Pacific	
	\widetilde{r}	σ	\widetilde{r}	σ
\bar{e}	0.40	3.0	0.51	4.5
$-\bar{p}$	0.51	4.0	0.39	4.7
$\bar{e}-\bar{p}$	0.73	4.3	0.64	6.5
${\rm div}{\bf Q}$	1.0	3.0	1.0	2.1



Figure 1: (a) Annual mean SSS (1955-2012) from the World Ocean Atlas (Zweng *et al.*, 2013) and (b) Annual mean (1979-2014) e-p from ERA-Interim vertically integrated moisture flux divergence. Gaussian filter applied to smooth data.



Figure 2: Basin-integrated net freshwater flux (E - P - R) for each ocean basin over different latitudinal extents: (a) approximately 35°S-45°N and (b) approximately 35°S-65°N. The latitude boundaries shown above each subfigure are approximate and do not apply to each estimate. Exact boundaries used in calculating each estimate are shown in Table 1. Estimates based on atmospheric data are shown first followed by the oceanographic estimates.



Figure 3: E-P-R for latitude bands within the (a) Atlantic, (b) Pacific and (c) Indian oceans for the estimates described in section 3. Latitudes below each subfigure refer to those used to break up ERA-Interim. The exact boundaries used in calculating each estimate are shown in Table 1. Crosses denote that there is no estimate provided for a band, otherwise E-P-R=0.



Figure 4: Annual mean area-averaged ERA-Interim (1979-2014) surface water fluxes in 10° latitude bands for the (a) Atlantic, (b) Pacific and (c) Indian oceans with Dai and Trenberth (2002) runoff divided into the same 10° latitude bands.



Figure 5: Differences between area-averaged annual mean ERA-Interim (1979-2014) Pacific and Atlantic surface water fluxes in 10° latitude bands scaled by area with Dai and Trenberth (2002) runoff divided into the same 10° latitude bands.



Figure 6: Climatological monthly means (1979-2014) of ERA-Interim \bar{e} and \bar{p} for the (a) Atlantic (35°S-60°N), (b) Pacific (30°S-Bering Strait) and (c) Indian (>35°S) Oceans at basin scale (first row of ERA-Interim columns in Table 1).



Figure 7: Climatological seasonal mean ERA-Interim e-p from accumulated surface forecasts 1980-2014 for (a) December-January-February (DJF), (b) March-April-May (MAM), (c) June-July-August (JJA) and (d) September-October-November (SON).



Figure 8: Climatological seasonal mean ERA-Interim evaporation 1980-2014 for (a) DJF, (b) MAM, (c) JJA and (d) SON.



Figure 9: Climatological seasonal mean ERA-Interim precipitation 1980-2014 for (a) DJF, (b) MAM, (c) JJA and (d) SON.



Figure 10: Climatological monthly means of ERA-Interim (1979-2014) Atlantic Ocean areaaveraged (a) evaporation and (b) precipitation in latitude bands representing the tropics, subtropics and northern hemisphere extratropics.



Figure 11: Climatological monthly means of ERA-Interim (1979-2014) of Pacific Ocean areaaveraged (a) evaporation and (b) precipitation in latitude bands representing the tropics, subtropics and northern hemisphere extratropics.



Figure 12: Yearly anomalies from the 1979-2014 area-averaged annual mean ERA-Interim \bar{e} , $-\bar{p}$, $\bar{e}-\bar{p}$, div**Q** and -GPCP for the (a) Atlantic, (b) Pacific and (c) Indian oceans at basin scale (first row of ERA-Interim columns in Table 1).